

## **2015 Regional Council Process & Consolidated Funding Applications**

### Background:

The Regional Economic Development Councils (REDCs) are a community driven, regional approach to economic development in New York State. Each Council consists of up to 30 business, academic and government leaders from throughout the Region.

In 2011, each of the ten Regional Councils were tasked with developing a five-year strategic plan that included a comprehensive vision for economic development for that region, regional strategies to achieve that vision, and specific priority projects that are significant, regionally supported and capable of stimulating economic investment. Empire State Development Corporation developed a competitive process in which Regional Council Strategic Plans containing recommendations for funding made by each Regional Council were reviewed by a Strategic Plan Review Committee consisting of two State Agency Commissioners and three economic development experts. Members of the 2011 Review Team included: Dall W. Forsythe, Senior Fellow at the Wagner School of Public Service at New York University and former Vice President for Finance and Operations at The Atlantic Philanthropies; Walter D. Broadnax, Professor of Public Administration at The Maxwell School of Syracuse University; Bruce J. Katz, Vice President at the Brookings Institution and founding Director of the Brookings Metropolitan Policy Program; Joan McDonald, Commissioner of the New York State Department of Transportation; and Cesar Perales, New York State Secretary of State. On December 8, 2011, the Governor and Legislative Leaders announced the winners of the first round of competition and one year later 97% of Round One projects were under contract and/or progressing.

In 2012, the Councils went a step further and produced Strategic Implementation Agendas that built upon the progress from the first round and further developed and refined their Regional Five Year Strategic Plans by undertaking four primary activities: Establishing a framework to advance the Regional Strategic Plan; Implementing the strategies laid out in the Strategic Plan; Creating a project pipeline; and providing a progress report documenting the success the Council has had in implementing its Strategic Plan.

In 2013, all ten of the Regional Councils competed against each other to be designated as a "Top Performer". The 2013 Council competition was designed with a similar framework as 2012 but added several new activities for the council to focus on that would continue to help develop and advance the original strategic plans. Regional Councils were asked to develop an Opportunity Agenda, identify Innovation Hot Spots, and advance regional Cleaner, Greener Community Sustainability Plans.

In 2014, the regional councils developed strategies for several new initiatives including a Global NY Plan to identify import/export and foreign direct investment (FDI) opportunities. Councils also created a Veteran's Work Group to address the unemployment of returning Veteran's in New York. The REDC's were asked to identify projects as part of NY Rising to assist in the rebuilding of areas devastated by natural disasters. The Councils also provided an update on their Opportunity Agenda, workforce development challenges, and their project pipeline.

This year, the REDCs launched the Regional Economic Cluster Program to ensure continued focus on the importance of industry cluster growth in statewide economic development efforts through partnerships between business, academia, and venture capital. As part of this year's competition, all the regional councils focused on initiatives that will drive implementation of their regional strategic plans, and to continue support for various State initiatives. Regional Council priorities include: development of strategies and projects that focus on the growth of regional economic clusters; advancement of plans and projects that strengthen the Global NY agenda; implementing additional strategies in their strategic plan; maintaining a pipeline of projects; training the workforce for today and tomorrow; and measuring the performance and progress of the strategic plan and CFA projects.

These actions were designed to encourage and accelerate implementation, performance, and collaboration within the regions. Priority projects that aligned with each region's plan were chosen by the Councils from the applications submitted to the Consolidated Funding Application portal. These projects were published in the regions' Progress Report, which are publically available online at [www.regionalcouncils.ny.gov](http://www.regionalcouncils.ny.gov). Projects were scored by both the state agencies and the Regional Councils. The agencies scored their projects based on a technical evaluation in adherence with existing funding program guidelines and awarded a project up to 80%. The remaining 20% is awarded by the Regional Councils, and were based off the following endorsement standards:

**Statewide Endorsement Standards**

*Regional Council members will determine the degree to which the application implements the regional strategic plan and assign the corresponding number of points as a score.*

IMPLEMENTATION OF THE PLAN	DEGREE	POINTS
The proposal is identified as a priority project by the Regional Council.	Priority	20
The proposal is identified in the plan and has regional benefits.	Very Strong	15
The proposal advances the plan and has local benefits.	Strong	10
The proposal is consistent with the plan and has project level benefits.	Moderate	5
The proposal has limited relationship to the plan	Weak	0

**2015 Competition:**

To encourage the implementation of the Regional Economic Development Councils' strategic plans and to continue to motivate investment opportunities and job creation, the Regional Councils competed in 2015 for up to \$150 million in capital funds and \$70 million in Excelsior

Tax Credits for projects identified by the Regional Councils in their regions. Round 5 of the REDC initiative also includes the creation of the Upstate Revitalization Initiative, in which 7 regions will compete for \$1.5B. This new initiative requires each council to develop regional investment plans that identify existing assets, highlight needs, and recommend areas of opportunity. Seven regions will be eligible to compete for a \$500 million revitalization awards: Mid-Hudson, Capital Region, Mohawk Valley, Central New York, North Country, Southern Tier and Finger Lakes. This initiative will help to transform local economies by providing three regions \$500 million over the next five years to support projects and strategies that create jobs, strengthen and diversify economies, and generate economic opportunity within the region.

As part of this year's competition, all the regional councils focused on initiatives that will drive implementation of their regional strategic plans, and to continue support for various State initiatives. Regional Council priorities include: development of strategies and projects that focus on the growth of regional economic clusters; advancement of plans and projects that strengthen the Global NY agenda; implementing additional strategies in their strategic plan; maintaining a pipeline of projects; training the workforce for today and tomorrow; and measuring the performance and progress of the strategic plan and CFA projects.

By incentivizing implementation of the strategic plans, Regional Councils, businesses, educational institutions, local governments, not-for-profit groups and other stakeholders are further motivated to work together to accomplish the regional vision. While project funding was awarded in all ten Regional Councils through the 2015 CFA, the competition placed an emphasis on Regional Council performance and action to implement strategies.

The competition was focused on the following:

- 1) *Implementation of regional strategic economic development plans;*
- 2) *Performance in encouraging economic growth through job creation and investment;*
- 3) *Identification of regional industry clusters;*

In 2015, the Regional Councils competed against each other to be designated as a "Top Performer" and 7 upstate regions competed to be designated as one of the three "URI Best Plan Awardee".

The 2015 Strategic Implementation Assessment Team (SIAT) was led by Secretary of State Cesar Perales and included Tax and Finance Commissioner Jerry Boone, Office of General Services Commissioner RoAnn Destito, Department of Transportation Commissioner Matthew Driscoll, Environmental Facilities Corporation President and CEO Sabrina Ty, NYS Upstate Revitalization Director Richard Tobe, Brookings Institution's Metropolitan Policy Program Senior Fellow Robert Puentes, National Urban League President Marc Morial, and the United States Department of Commerce Northeast Regional Director James Cox. Due to the unprecedented commitment of state funds to economic development in the 2015 State Budget, the SIAT was expanded to include four additional members that were appointed by the Legislature. Those members include Hon. James Seward, State Senate District 51; Hon. Kenneth LaValle, State Senate District 1; Hon. Donna Lupardo, State Assembly District 123; and Hon. Herman Farrell,

State Assembly District 71. The SIAT reviewed each region's Progress Report and Upstate Revitalization Plans based on established criteria. Members of all REDC's traveled to Albany and presented a summary of their 2015 activities and priorities to the SIAT which included PowerPoint presentations, videos, and regional exhibit booths. The SIAT was also given time to ask questions of the REDC's about their progress reports and regional priority projects.

The SIAT provided an assessment of each plan and made recommendations to Howard Zemsky, President & CEO, Empire State Development Corporation of the six reports that most closely aligned with the criteria outlined in the guidebook. President Zemsky accepted the recommendations of the Committee and, pursuant to his statutory powers as head of the Urban Development Corporation, awarded three regions with the Best Plan Award of \$500 million and three regions with the top Progress Report up to \$45 million in funding consisting of \$30 million in capital grants and up to \$15 million in Excelsior tax credits for priority projects identified in their Strategic Plans. The balance of the incentives was awarded to projects identified by the Councils as in alignment with their strategies and priorities.

In addition, project sponsors applied for over \$500 million in economic development resources available from twelve state agencies through the Consolidated Funding Application (CFA). The CFA allows businesses and other entities to apply for multiple agency funding sources through a single, web-based application. Awards for CFA projects were made based on the endorsement of the local Regional Council and the technical program review of the agencies providing resources, subject to interagency review team analysis and agency discretion.

The 2015 REDC initiative was launched on April 29 and the CFA opened for applications on May 01 and closed on July 31. All details about CFA resources were made available online via the 2015 CFA Resources Available Document, the New York State Register and the Grants Gateway. When the portal closed on July 31, agencies immediately began marking project eligibility. All eligible projects were then made available to the Regional Councils for their scoring process and the agencies for their technical evaluation. On September 21, the REDCs submitted their final 2015 progress reports to the State. Final URI reports were submitted on October, 5. After the SIAT presentations concluded in October, the Inter-agency team met to review the projects and make final funding decisions.

The interagency team reviewed projects based on relevant factors including Regional Councils Implementation Agendas and designation of priority projects, project alignment with regional goals and objectives, funding availability and regional need. Priority projects are those specifically enumerated in the Regional Council Reports, receiving a score of 20 from the Regional Council, and identified as significant, regionally supported and capable of stimulating economic investment.

The interagency team once again consisted of professional staff from relevant agencies and authorities' with detailed knowledge of their respective CFA program funding. This group conducted an analytical assessment that provided the basis for project funding recommendations made by individual agencies for final approval by respective agency or authority head. As provided in the budget, the Regional Council Grant funds were awarded by ESD in its discretion.

This process resulted in funding of projects that aligned with a long term, regionally generated implementation agendas and are capable of stimulating economic growth and investment.

On Thursday, December 10, 2015, the Governor announced that 1062 projects totaling \$999.7 million had been awarded through Round Five of the Regional Economic Development Council initiative. URI Best Plan Awards were given to Central New York, Finger Lakes and Southern Tier. Top Performer awards were given to the Mohawk Valley, Long Island, and Capital District regions in adherence to the competition guidelines detailed above.

## MEMORANDUM

**To:** Howard Zemsky, President and CEO of the Empire State Development Corporation

**From:** Cesar Perales, Secretary of State  
Jerry Boone, Commissioner, New York State Department of Taxation and Finance  
James Cox, Northeast Regional Director at the United States Department of Commerce  
RoAnn Destito, Commissioner, Office of General Services  
Matthew Driscoll, Commissioner, Department of Transportation  
Marc Morial, President of the National Urban League  
Robert Puentes, Senior Fellow and Director with the Brookings Institution  
Richard Tobe, Director of Upstate Revitalization for New York State  
Sabrina Ty, President and CEO of the Environmental Facilities Corporation  
Assemblyman Herman “Denny” Farrell, of the 71<sup>st</sup> District  
Assemblywoman Donna Lupardo, of the 123<sup>rd</sup> District  
Senator Kenneth LaValle, of the 1<sup>st</sup> District  
Senator James Seward, of the 51<sup>st</sup> District

**Subject:** Review of Progress for the 2015 Regional Economic Development Council Initiative and Review of Plans for the Upstate Revitalization Competition

**Date:** December 9, 2015

---

We are honored to serve as the Strategic Implementation Assessment Team (SIAT) for Governor Cuomo’s Regional Economic Development Council (REDC) and Upstate Revitalization Initiatives (URI). In the past five years, the REDC initiative has made serious progress in job creation and the growth of new industries across New York State. This year, after the success of the Buffalo Billion, Governor Cuomo launched the \$1.5 billion URI competition to transform the economy of upstate New York.

In 2011, each Regional Council was charged with developing a five-year Strategic Economic Development Plan that emphasized their region’s unique assets and provided strategies to harness local resources, both human and capital, to stimulate regional economic development, and create jobs statewide. Each year since, the plans have been updated to identify projects that support each region’s vision of its economic future.

The REDC program shifted the state's economic development approach from top-down mandates to a community-driven planning process. With this shift, the State has asked the REDCs to use their unique understanding of their regional economies to implement important State priorities. In year five (2015) of the REDC competition, Regional Councils were asked to address one major new State priority: the development of strategies and projects that focus on the growth of one regional economic cluster.

In 2015, in addition to updating their Strategic Economic Development Plans and focusing on a regional economic cluster, seven upstate regions also prepared a Revitalization Plan to explain how they would leverage \$500 million of state funding to stimulate public and private investment in the region. Each region was charged with engaging their community in drafting a data-driven plan that builds on evolving REDC strategies and looks comprehensively at the regional economy.

This October, the Regional Councils came to Albany to present their progress, and, where applicable, their URI proposals. Their oral presentations complemented the regional Progress Reports and Revitalization Plans submitted by the Regional Councils in September and early October. We listened to those presentations and have the responsibility of assessing the progress of the ten Regional Councils and the Revitalization plans submitted by the seven Regional Councils competing in the URI.

### **2015 Annual REDC Competition**

Our task was to evaluate all ten regions based on the competition and Regional Council priorities as described in the 2015 REDC Guidebook. We focused on these four areas:

- 1) Development of strategies and projects for a Regional Economic Cluster Plan
- 2) Implementation of regional strategic economic development plans, including the following 2015 priorities:
  - Advancement of projects and activities to strengthen the region's Global NY plan
  - Updating plans to address new regional priorities, conditions, and emerging opportunities
  - Maintaining a project pipeline
  - Workforce training to fill regional workforce development needs
  - Identification and reporting on indicators measuring regional progress and tracking key regional issues
- 3) Updates on ongoing initiatives:

- Identification of projects to implement the region's Opportunity Agenda and train hard-to-place workers
- Selection of an existing business incubator for additional funding
- Implementation of Cleaner, Greener Communities Sustainability Plans
- Promotion of veterans participation in the workforce
- Support to NY Rising Community Reconstruction Plan projects
- Collaboration with universities on NYSUNY 2020 and CUNY 2020 plans
- Engaging local government officials in the REDC process

4) Progress and performance in encouraging economic growth:

- Impact on job creation and retention
- Business growth and leverage of private sector investment
- Advancement of past priority projects
- Public engagement

### **URI Competition**

In the URI competition, our task was to evaluate the seven competing regions based on their readiness to create and maintain new jobs, attract and retain private sector investment, and contribute to the growth of wealth in the region. In addressing those goals, the regions were asked to identify their challenges and weaknesses and incorporate key concepts identified by the state, as well as any additional elements relevant to the region. We focused on these areas to guide our evaluation:

1) Progress:

- The region's foundations for economic growth
- The use of data to support identified challenges and opportunities and position the region for success

2) Planning:

- Connectivity of the plan across industries and geographical barriers
- Targeting of innovative sectors and community investment that would lead to transformative change
- Strategies and actions to attract investment and support growth
- Sustainability of investments
- Workforce development and hard-to-place workers



- Implementation strategies and organizational structure

3) Projects:

- Development of projects ready for immediate implementation
- Conceptual projects developing in the pipeline

4) Participation:

- Community outreach and business engagement
- Engagement of local government leaders
- Collaboration and regional support for the plan

5) Performance:

- Ability to increase private sector jobs and generate significant private sector investment
- Readiness to create a widespread increase of wealth in the region

### **Awards**

The seven regions participating in the URI competed for three awards of up to \$500 million each, to be distributed over five years, in addition to \$30 million in agency funds through the Consolidated Funding Application. The URI regions consisted of the Capital Region, Central New York, the Finger Lakes, the Mid-Hudson, Mohawk Valley, the North Country, and the Southern Tier.

The Strategic Implementation Assessment Team has identified three regions that deserve the highest awards for the URI: **Central NY, the Finger Lakes, and the Southern Tier**. This was a challenging undertaking, as every region devoted substantial energy to the process and presented impressive plans for transformation.

However, the regions we are recommending presented particularly promising Revitalization Plans and should receive up to \$130 million this year.

The **Central New York Regional Economic Development Council (CNYREDC)** presented a tenacious plan for the revitalization of the region. The plan focused on investing in key growth drivers, building an economy inclusive of all residents, and developing enablers of prosperity. One major growth driver is designed to establish the region's global competitiveness in precision sensing technologies and data analytics, which will build on

the region's interregional collaborations on unmanned aircraft systems and the Internet of Things. To strengthen the region's agribusiness sector, the CNYREDC presented plans for coordinated efforts that will extend the shelf life and safety of food products grown in the state. The CNYREDC had a thoughtful approach to public engagement, evidenced by their launch and promotion of a "Big Idea Competition" that converted over 200 public submissions into project proposals and long-term priorities for the region. This spirit of robust public engagement and inclusiveness was also reflected in the region's tactical approach to building an economy that provides opportunities for workers of different backgrounds, training, and educational levels. The plan identified several prosperity enablers that are necessary to sustain the region's growth, including strengthening innovation and providing targeted entrepreneurship opportunities in diverse communities of veterans, women, and minorities. The plan also identified a number of community investment opportunities, and collaborative models for cultural and tourism assets that will contribute to the attractiveness of the region and help retain talented graduates from the region's academic institution.

The **Finger Lakes Regional Economic Development Council (FLREDC)** provided a convincing argument that the region is well poised to take advantage of the URI investment. The region focused on three key growth pillars that are essential to its future growth. The first is optics, photonics and imaging (OPI). Innovation in this longstanding regional cluster continues to grow, as seen by the recent award to the American Institute of Manufacturing Integrated Photonics from the Department of Defense. The second growth pillar is agriculture and food production, where the region plans to build a food ecosystem across the region that will maintain the region's status as the leading food producer in the state. The third growth pillar is next generation manufacturing and technology, where the region has taken a comprehensive approach to ensuring the vitality of the Eastman Business Park as well as the Western New York Science and Technology Advanced Manufacturing Park (STAMP) in Genesee County. The FLREDC identified three enablers that are necessary to sustain and stimulate growth: pathways to prosperity, which created strong connections to the Rochester-Monroe Anti-Poverty Initiative (RMAPI); entrepreneurship and development; and higher education and research. Overall, the region is prepared to build on their strengths and take serious steps to address various workforce and community needs.

The **Southern Tier Regional Economic Development Council (STREDC)** presented a strong plan for the transformation of their region. The Revitalization Plan focused on growing the advanced economy through the development of the Greater Binghamton Innovation Ecosystem, strategic investments in advanced manufacturing, transformation of the food and agriculture industry, and promotion of the Southern

Tier's innovative culture. Each of these initiatives builds regional connectivity and ensures lasting bonds between the public sector, private sector, and educational institutions. Proposed innovation districts in Binghamton, Endicott, and Johnson City will benefit from local higher education institutions and innovation cultivators, such as the Southern Tier Startup Alliance, a state-designated Innovation Hot Spot. The STREDC clearly laid out underlying actions needed to support its growth, including the enhancement of regional supply chains of existing advanced manufacturers and the attraction and training of skilled STEM workers. To improve agricultural output, the region proposes leveraging its longstanding partnerships with Cornell University and Corning Inc. to test and eventually apply new agricultural and clean energy technologies. These technologies will extend growing seasons and expand controlled environment agriculture (CEA), bringing the region to the forefront of CEA. With the understanding that industry growth must be complemented by community development in order to attract talent, the STREDC prioritized investments that will improve community assets and attract young talent.

The Strategic Implementation Assessment Team has identified three regions that were Top Performers in the annual REDC competition: **the Capital Region, the Mohawk Valley, and Long Island**. The substantial progress that each region accomplished made this a difficult decision; however, the achievements of these regions merit the designation of Top Performer and awards of up to \$105 million.

The **Capital Region Regional Economic Development Council (CREDC)** continued its substantial commitment to the branding and development of the region as the Tech Valley. The CREDC focused its cluster plan on research, development, and commercialization. The region structured its approach to leverage pioneering academic institutions, a highly educated workforce, and competitive private sector partners. Past investments in research institutions have successfully built investments with interregional benefits and far-reaching impact. The CREDC refined its Global NY strategies and identified multiple projects that advance the Global NY agenda. The region presented metrics that illuminate challenges for employment among many minorities and reinforce the direction of the region's Opportunity Agenda. Significant efforts are being undertaken to increase access to employment in areas of distress, particularly through the Kindl Workforce Development Building in Schenectady and the Tech Valley Center of Gravity in Troy. The inclusiveness of the region's efforts are further supported by the enthusiastic backing of the CREDC by local governments, not-for-profits, educational institutions, and private partners.

The **Mohawk Valley Regional Economic Development Council (MVREDC)** excelled in its pursuit of high-impact STEM intensive industries. The region selected cybersecurity as its regional cluster, identified key public institutions and private businesses that are active in this industry, and described actions needed to maximize the potential for new relationships among these stakeholders. The progress report laid out a cradle-to-career action plan to fill the need for more STEM-trained workers in this growing field as well as the infrastructure improvements necessary to guarantee the region's competitive advantage. Detailed performance metrics were introduced that provided context for strategies and supports the direction of ongoing initiatives, including the region's Opportunity Agenda. The progress report aptly conveyed the renewed excitement in the region, especially with the realization of past ambitions and investments in the Marcy Nanocenter and Quad-C. Although the MV500 regional strategy team was created to help draft the URI plan, it also served to enhance the region's active engagement of the public and private sectors, government, and educational stakeholders.

The **Long Island Regional Economic Development Council (LIREDC)** maintained its focus on key initiatives, most strongly addressing its innovation and industry clusters, with a focus on supporting potential sites for biotech space, as well as supporting leading centers of bio-innovation, such as Cold Spring Harbor and Stony Brook. The LIREDC recognizes that top talent and an educated workforce will help move the biotech industry forward on Long Island, and has identified steps needed to increase the supply of trained employees and foster collaboration between higher education institutions and research companies. Through its Opportunity Agenda, the LIREDC continues to support a variety of initiatives to support the entry of hard-to-place workers into the Long Island economy, including the creation of affordable housing and extension of primary healthcare to high need communities. The region's project pipeline is robust, strengthened by redevelopment opportunities at the Nassau Hub, including a planned cancer treatment and research center.

Four regions should receive up to \$90 million to help attract and grow business in their regions: **the Mid-Hudson, New York City, the North Country, and Western NY.**

The **Mid-Hudson Regional Economic Development Council (MHREDC)** continued to concentrate on its four core strategies for technology, mature Industries, natural resources, and infrastructure. This continuity contributes to the strong brand identity of the region, which was refined this year as a part of the URI and well integrated into the Progress Report. The selection of the food and beverage manufacturing supply chain as the MHREDC key industry cluster was based on an evaluation of existing regional strengths and an analysis of industry trend data. This cluster is a fast-growing industry in

the region and thematically aligned with the region's original 2011 plan. In workforce development, the MVREDC engaged local community colleges as part of the Hudson Valley Educational Consortium to host regional job fairs and create a network of information for potential entrepreneurs. Other implementation activities include the formation of an International Trade and Investment Advisory Committee under the region's Global NY agenda.

The **North Country Regional Economic Development Council (NCREDC)** focused on the transportation equipment and materials industry cluster, where the region has seen a dramatic rise in employment with higher than average regional wages. This cluster merges the manufacturing of transportation equipment with the need to develop and manufacture advanced materials that companies can use in next-generation transit systems. Significant implementation activities include the strengthening of the NCREDC's Opportunity Agenda with the development of new economic development strategies and the refinement of strategies under the Global NY agenda. Progress in prior investments has been encouraging, with projects around Fort Drum helping to prevent large-scale layoffs and the Wild Walk at the Wild Center in Tupper Lake breaking attendance records this summer. The NCREDC informed its approach to new investments through outreach activities that included events with local farmers and presentations at local government conferences.

The **Western NY Regional Economic Development Council (WNYREDC)** continues to embrace its three core strategies of workforce enhancement, entrepreneurship, and smart growth to provide a regional foundation by which its seven strategic industries can grow and prosper. This year it focused on materials processing and machinery manufacturing for its cluster industry action plan and identified detailed actions to support the cluster. Successful implementation of workforce initiatives and other actions in the region is bearing fruit through increased employment in advanced manufacturing and a rise in the young adult population by 5.4% over four years. The region's commitment to meeting the educational and workforce needs of area veterans – access to employment counselors, helping develop educational plans, and promoting veteran employment to potential employers – is evidenced in its support for expanding the coverage area of the Veterans One-Stop Center of Western New York.

The **New York City Regional Economic Development Council (NYCREDC)** turned its focus this year to the development of an industry cluster called "Smart Cities," which includes technology to help manage and deliver government services and public infrastructure. NYCREDC has already taken multiple steps to implement the Smart Cities cluster, such as securing a commitment of resources from NYC, and identifying future

infrastructure initiatives to promote and expedite. Multiple priority projects are proposed within the advanced manufacturing, biomedical, tourism, food processing, media, and IT industries. Workforce development continues to be a top priority for the NYCREDC. To address this gap, its strategy is to build extensive partnerships; to target funding that leads to gainful employment and the upward mobility of residents; and to build a workforce development system that is focused on demand-driven strategies. The expansion of successful employer-partnership workforce training models will help bridge pervasive skill gaps and address workforce readiness issues.

## **Conclusion**

The Strategic Implementation Assessment Team was impressed by the dedication of Regional Council members, work group volunteers, and staff of the Regional Empire State Development offices who serve the Regional Councils. We believe that the continuation of this bottom-up process, which included this year's Upstate Revitalization Initiative, is taking New York down a path of great success, driven by the informed perspective of REDC members, spurred on by the advancement of new ideas and products by business leaders and educational institutions, and fueled by the development of a workforce across all age groups and socioeconomic strata. Please extend our congratulations to all members of the Regional Councils for the outstanding work they are doing to strengthen New York's economy.

# Southern Tier Regional Economic Development Council

## 2015 Progress Report Assessment

### Section I. Planning

#### a. Quality of the Progress Report

##### Strengths

- The State of the region section was concise and thorough.
- Four new initiatives were adopted to drive the next five-year plan for the region, as laid out in the revitalization plan.
- The report was very data driven.

##### Weaknesses

- The detailed industry cluster plan, adopted September 2015, was omitted from the progress report.

#### b. Development of regional metrics to measure success

##### Strengths

- Transportation equipment is a strong sector to invest in because it is a large employer with the highest average wage in the region.
- To help alleviate the high concentration of poverty in the City of Binghamton, the region created a new initiative entitled “Build the Greater Binghamton Innovation Ecosystem” which focuses on making the Binghamton area a destination for talent, new business development and partnerships for commercialization of emerging technologies. Innovation districts will capitalize on public-private collaboration and the growing presence of Binghamton University.
- The Southern Tier is home to 4.5% of all students enrolled in the state, yet just 3.4% of the total population.

##### Weaknesses

- None noted.

#### c. Identification of regional workforce development needs for key sectors

##### Strengths

- SUNY Broome made several recommendations for new programs that support the projected growth in the healthcare industry in the Greater Binghamton area.
- STREDC adopted a new initiative to invest in the Advanced Manufacturing Industry, and recognized that it requires a specialized skilled workforce.
- The Tourism Work Group recommended the creation of a tourism institute that would provide training.
- STREDC supports a 2015 Priority Project by Binghamton University to renovate a site for the Decker School of Nursing and the new Health and Science Innovation Park in Johnson City.

### Weaknesses

- There is little discussion in the progress report with regard to workforce initiatives and implementation plans specific to industry sectors, although this is addressed in greater detail in the URI plan.

## **d. Readiness of the region**

### Strengths

- STREDC has a stable vision for the region.
- The Southern Tier Startup Alliance (STSA) plans to continue to increase the number of entrepreneurs supported by entrepreneurs-in-residence and workshops, and play a key role in the new 76West initiative.
- Thirteen percent of the region's population is either undergraduate or graduate students.
- Engineering and design will be well underway by the end of 2015 for many of the 17 NY Rising projects, and most construction should be completed in 2016.

### Weaknesses

- Since 2000, the Southern Tier has lost 6% of its labor force, compared to growth at the state and national level (5% and 9%, respectively). Every county in the region, with the exception of Tompkins County, lost labor force over the same period. Broome and Chemung lost the most, 10%, followed by Delaware, Schuyler, and Tioga each with 9% loss.
- Employment loss in both manufacturing and the STEM related industries could be better addressed.

## **Section II. Performance**

### **a. Impact on job creation and retention**

### Strengths

- The Southern Tier had a total of 91 CFA projects awarded in 2014, and estimates they will retain 1,637 jobs and created another 832 permanent jobs.
- 2011-2014 CFA projects that are moving forward are estimated to result in 12,441 jobs retained, 4,050 permanent jobs created, and 3,520 construction jobs.
- Most of the region's top ten industries have added jobs since 2009.
- Food and agriculture manufacturing employment grew nearly 23% between 2010 and 2014, adding a total of 1,595 in the food & agriculture industry cluster between 2009 and 2013, with food manufacturing adding 1,000 jobs.
- Employment in service-related industries is rising. Between 2000 and 2014, employment in health care, arts and entertainment, and hospitality increased by 16%, 17%, and 18% respectively.

### Weaknesses

- The region lost more than 16,000 jobs since 2000, with a loss of over 3,900 just since 2009. The Southern Tier lagged behind statewide job growth, as state jobs have increased by 6% since 2000.



## **b. Success in job training and engagement of hard-to-place workers**

### Strengths

- The SUNY Broome Workforce project is on schedule to be completed (2014 CFA). This renovation and construction of a Hospitality Education Center will provide individuals skills in the latest techniques, making them job-ready candidates with local employers.
- The expansion of the Cornell Veterinary School is near completion. This will expand classroom, lab and clinical space to increase class size in response to demand.
- Several colleges are collaborating to create an on-line repository for students and veterans to learn about internship opportunities in the private sector

### Weaknesses

- Southern Tier's Opportunity Agenda Work Group discussed the fact that the private sector must be involved and that the community colleges would be critical but didn't elaborate how to engage them.

## **c. Business growth and leverage of private sector investments**

### Strengths

- The leverage of total project cost to ESD Capital Fund investment of all Priority Project in 2014 was 7.7:1, and 8.5:1 among all Priority Projects from 2011-2014.
- The leverage of total project cost to CFA funds for all CFA projects in 2014 was 6.1:1, and 6.3:1 among all CFA projects from 2011 -2014.
- The Southern Tier's Rural Initiative Fund was established in Round 1 and has been helpful in building the agriculture and forest industry. A total of \$4,391,421 in loans has been issued, leveraging \$5,246,764 in other sources of project financing. The result has been creation of 156 jobs, retention of 25 jobs and an increase of 443 acres in production.
- The increase in small firms compared to a decrease in large firms is an indicator of the strength of small business in the Southern Tier, as well as a growing entrepreneurial community.

### Weaknesses

- None noted.

## **Section III. Progress**

### **a. Advancement of the Region's 2014-15 Implementation Agenda**

#### Strengths

- During 2015, work began on 17 Southern Tier projects that will result in a total investment of \$22 million in federal funds, advancing the NY Rising Community Reconstruction program.
- The 2013 regional incubator plan created a partnership of Cornell University, Binghamton University, the Ceramics Corridor and major corporate entities such as Corning Incorporated and Lockheed. Renovation of the 9,000 square foot building continues with 2013 CFA funds.

- The region made progress implementing its Cleaner Greener Plan. Many action items and tasks have been completed and there are several projects proposed that would continue advancing the plan.
- Seven communities in the region are taking advantage of NYSERDA funding for NY Prize Microbid Feasibility grants.

#### Weaknesses

- Information was lacking with regard to the implementation of the 2014 workforce development plan.

### **b. Advancement and completion of prior round Priority Projects**

#### Strengths

- Almost all past Priority Projects are completed (36%) or on schedule (48%). All but 3 of the 26 Priority Projects awarded in 2014 are under contract.
- For all CFA projects awarded in the past four years, 34% are complete and 53% are on schedule. Only 20 out of 334 projects have been declined or cancelled.
- The Southern Tier has 81 Priority Projects and 74% are either complete or underway.
- In 2014, the STSA Entrepreneurs-in-Residence met with over 350 entrepreneurs and startups in the partner incubators and throughout the region, spending over 750 hours on mentoring. This summer, STSA's Hardware Accelerator completed its pilot round, putting 9 startup teams through a 12-week rapid prototyping program.
- The Southern Tier Community Revitalization Program created 249 jobs and retained 24. This project is ongoing and intends to renovate 57 downtown buildings, create 130 new housing units, 43 new commercial spaces and 4 new road and bridge construction projects.
- The Corning Heavy Duty Diesel project was completed in 2014 and officially opened in 2015. The company now has the capacity to meet global demand for emission control equipment. A total of 250 new jobs have been created.
- A new Global Center to house international student support programs and services is under construction at Binghamton University.

#### Weaknesses

- Very few Priority Projects are in Tioga and Chenango Counties.

### **c. Ability to take the next steps in growing the regional economy**

#### Strengths

- The Global NY work group considered the trends in export activity, and recommended the STREDC place a high priority on providing funding support to both companies seeking to expand export activity and those that are foreign-owned and plan to increase the level of foreign investment. Examples include Raymond Corporation and DeMet's Candy.

### Weaknesses

- Although a need for increased shovel-ready-sites was mentioned as an objective under the economic backbone strategy, there was no clarification or plan of work to do so.

## **Section IV. Projects**

### **a. Solicitation and development of projects for regional economic growth, including transformational projects with large scale targeted job growth**

#### Strengths

- STREDC selected Transportation Products, Components and System Controls as their key industry cluster to take advantage of their strength in manufacturing and strong location quotient. It is the third largest employment sector in the region. Many further details are in the revitalization plan.
- A number of projects that will advance the region's key industry cluster were proposed, such as a natural gas pipeline, equipment purchase to expand a transit product factory, and a batter dry room.
- National Pipe and Plastics, Inc. is constructing a new 19,300 square foot facility that will serve as their new corporate headquarters. They expect to retain 194 jobs and create 5.
- Cameron Manufacturing plans to acquire property, expand its manufacturing facilities, and add 39 jobs in the advanced manufacturing industry sector.

#### Weaknesses

- None noted.

### **b. Identification of projects to advance State and regional priorities**

#### Strengths

- Regional strategies related to health care will be addressed by 2015 Priority Projects. For example, Corning Community Health Education Complex will be a downtown center for healthy living and health-based education.
- A wastewater treatment plan in the Village of Walton would construct an aerobic digester to provide a disposal site for local industries, part of a Cleaner Greener and energy efficiency initiative.
- Development of a mixed-use parking, residential, and retail/commercial facility that will enhance business development in the urban core of Binghamton. This is to advance the economic backbone strategy, the Opportunity Agenda, and NY Rising.
- Thirty-three CFA projects were advance to address both state and regional priorities.

#### Weaknesses

- It is unclear how some of the projects designated as addressing the needs of veterans or the opportunity agenda actually do so.

### **c. Building and maintaining a project pipeline for future funding opportunities**

#### Strengths

- The many work groups identified and evaluated project proposals.
- Binghamton University began construction on the Southern Tier High Technology Incubator this spring, a 2012 CFA project. The incubator, being built in a distressed area of downtown Binghamton, will provide high-tech space for companies focusing on energy, microelectronics, and healthcare. It is expected to result in the creation of 12 companies and 900 jobs over the next 9 years.
- The City of Ithaca and Cornell University are taking the first steps to revitalize the College Town area with the relocation of a firehouse and university buildings. The project is expected to impact tourism, attract talent and be one of the first projects in the Promote the Southern Tier's Innovative Culture initiative.

#### Weaknesses

- None noted.

## **Section V. Participation**

### **a. Engagement of the community, public, and other stakeholders in the Regional Council process**

#### Strengths

- Key players from various sectors participate in the different work groups. These include higher education, local government, the private sector, trade associations and unions.
- The Energy Work Group was particularly active this year and engaged in several meetings to identify ways to increase employment in the energy sector, as well as infusing energy efficiency and technology in STREDC projects at all levels.

#### Weaknesses

- Although the membership of the groups is diverse, it would be beneficial to include more companies from the private sector. There were few compared to the other types of organizations involved.
- There was no mention in the progress report on the use of social media, which could engage a younger demographic, although online tools like a survey and web conferencing were used.

### **b. Collaboration with local government to transform the regional business climate**

#### Strengths

- An online opinion survey for the community was conducted and received 509 individual responses.
- One-on-one meetings were held with municipal leaders at the county, city, town and village levels to discuss the feasibility of projects, facilitate collaboration among government entities, bring together public and private sector partners, identify resources, and provided guidance in selecting potential funding paths through the CFA Round.
- Schuyler and Yates counties conducted a feasibility study to explore shared services and even the possibility of a merger. While a merger was considered too difficult to accomplish, several tax-saving

opportunities are under discussion. One innovative proposal under consideration by both legislatures is a jail facility that would serve both counties.

Weaknesses

- Local government engagement in transforming the business climate was weak.

**c. Regional unity and support of the Progress Report**

Strengths

- Continued effort by the work groups to advance the strategic objectives of both the state and the region with the alignment of projects and initiatives.

Weaknesses

- None noted.

# Southern Tier Regional Economic Development Council

## 2015 Revitalization Plan Assessment

### Section I. Progress

#### Foundations for Growth

##### a. Regional performance clearly reported

###### Strengths

- The presentation of performance was clear and used a variety of data sources, both those provided by the State and other sources identified by the STREDC. For example, employment trends data from the Labor Department documented long-term job loss since 2000, while tourism data from various sources were gathered by the Council to argue for the importance of this sector.
- The plan has a map showing its distressed communities and key economic/demographic metrics for each (population, poverty, unemployment, income).

###### Weaknesses

- The revitalization plan makes occasional reference to previous STREDC projects but there is no focused discussion of progress achieved through previous Regional Council supported projects.

##### b. Identification of challenges and opportunities was supported by data

###### Strengths

- Challenges are documented in detail, with issues that tend to be more common in rural regions (old housing stock, aging population, outmigration, etc.). Challenges are consistent with the strategies and actions taken by the STREDC since 2011 (e.g., health care system improvements, farm economy revitalization, and regional broadband development).
- The data used to support challenges and opportunities is consistent with data supplied by the state. The Council used other data sources to measure the state of innovative culture in the region.
- Opportunities for the region documented through data include strong industry clusters in manufacturing and agriculture, falling unemployment, and an increase in the number of small private firms.
- The targeting of agriculture and food processing is well-supported both with economic data (e.g., multipliers) and an assessment of the region's assets (e.g., Cornell College of Agriculture and Life Sciences, abundance of fresh water). The Southern Tier possesses 16% of all Upstate farmland. Food manufacturing has over 3 times the employment that would be expected for a region of its size, compared to national trends.

###### Weaknesses

- Some opportunities presented are based on very recent trends (e.g., adult in-migration to the region).

### **c. Positioning of region for success**

#### Strengths

- Much of the revitalization plan has a job creation focus that is consistent with prior REDC activities. Over the past four years the STREDC has been effective at identifying and fostering projects with substantial job creation and retention impacts. The URI plan would extend this job focus by creating an estimated 10,000+ jobs, particularly in advanced manufacturing.
- The Plan makes a sound argument that its strong innovative culture, resurgence from natural disasters earlier in the decade, geographic location and other factors poise it for growth.
- The STREDC presents an approach, guiding principles and philosophy that drove the revitalization planning process. Its philosophy has several guiding principles:
  - Maximize intellectual capital
  - Innovation at the local level
  - Meaningful public-private partnerships
  - Build on natural assets
  - Value of entrepreneurship
  - Return of vibrancy to communities
  - Workforce development

#### Weaknesses

- None noted.

### **Investment in the Region**

#### **d. Connectivity will lead to transformative change**

#### Strengths

- All four initiatives focus on region-wide connectivity and building of industry clusters. For example, Promoting the Southern Tier's Innovative Culture includes branding and tourism marketing to promote the region's culture. Similarly, the Advanced Manufacturing and Food/Agriculture initiatives would benefit broad swaths of the Southern Tier.
- The revitalization plan presents partnerships between industry and higher education. An example is Corning Corporation's work on ceramics and other materials with Alfred, Binghamton and Cornell Universities, adapting products made for consumer electronics to use in vehicle design.
- Responsibility for implementation involves partnering among individuals, target industries, academia, the nonprofit sector and government.
- The Greater Binghamton Innovation Ecosystem is a combination of projects in Binghamton, Johnson City and Endicott and initiative-wide projects to support real estate revitalization and workforce development.

#### Weaknesses

- It is unclear if connectivity will increase beyond building on mostly existing relationships.

## **e. Targeting of innovative sectors**

### Strengths

- Targeting is generally supported by data analysis, such as documentation supporting advanced manufacturing with a specialization in transportation equipment. For example, the region has over 2.5 times the manufacturing jobs that would be expected for a region its size, compared with national trends.
- The region's key industry cluster - Transportation Products, Components and System Controls – is integrated into the Advanced Manufacturing initiative, through projects like the Advanced Rail Technology Center in Hornell, as well as proposed investments in transportation spin-off companies, start-ups and suppliers.
- Innovation will be promoted through all four initiatives. For example, the Greater Binghamton initiative proposes a biopharmaceutical hub, a hybrid powertrain test center and a microgrid energy generation, storage and conversion pilot plant.

### Weaknesses

- The case for tourism as a target cluster could have been more compelling (tourism in the region employs a smaller share of the workforce than both Upstate and NYS overall, although that share is increasing). It is unclear what the connection of tourism is to innovation, although they are grouped together in the “Promote the Southern Tier’s Innovative Culture” initiative.

## **f. Unique regional strengths will overcome barriers to growth**

### Strengths

- The region has an educated workforce and sizeable student population, with over half the population having some college education. About 13% of residents are undergraduate or graduate students.
- The region benefits from strong industry clusters in manufacturing and agriculture, rising employment in service-related industries, and falling unemployment.
- A strong regional innovative culture is demonstrated through several metrics. For example, patents per worker and STEM jobs as a share of total jobs are both higher in the region than in Upstate or NYS overall. Per capita R&D spending has grown nearly 50% since 2000.

### Weaknesses

- The region's challenges, including a shrinking labor force, continued out-migration of residents, low wages, and poverty are weighty and will require sustained effort to adequately address, a point which could have been stated more clearly in some plan elements.

## **g. Choice of areas for physical and community investment**

### Strengths

- The revitalization plan identifies specific locations for projects and initiatives. A list of 21 ready-to-go projects is presented for both regional advanced manufacturers and affiliated academic institutions.



- The Greater Binghamton iDistricts apply smart growth principles to Binghamton, Endicott and Johnson City, through projects including a Route 434 greenway pedestrian and bicycle trail and expansion of the regional fiber optic network into Broome County. All three districts will benefit from local higher education institutions and “innovation cultivators” such as the Southern Tier Startup Alliance, a state-designated Innovation Hot Spot.

#### Weaknesses

- Two of the plan initiatives – Food and Agriculture and Innovative Culture – are somewhat unclear on physical locations for their investments.

## **Section II. Planning**

### **Strategies and Actions**

#### **a. Strategies to attract investment**

##### Strengths

- Strategies are generally grounded in a realistic assessment of the region’s economic performance and growth prospects.

##### Weaknesses

- With the exception of a reference to food processing, the attraction of international investment and jobs is not discussed in detail.

#### **b. Identification of actions required to support growth**

##### Strengths

- Game-changing investments for the Greater Binghamton Innovation Ecosystem are distinct and well defined. Projects range from traditional real estate projects to quality-of-life investments such as a greenway/bike trail that would connect Binghamton University in Vestal with downtown Binghamton.
- The plan is also very clear on needed actions to support the Advanced Manufacturing initiative. Key actions include: enhancing regional supply chains of existing advanced manufacturers, building worker skills and attracting STEM workers, and supporting key technologies like cybersecurity and batteries.
- For the Invest in the Advanced Manufacturing Industry initiative, several specific businesses are identified as investment targets/partners, including Raymond Corporation and Lockheed Martin.

##### Weaknesses

- Actions for the Agriculture/Food and Innovative Culture strategies could be presented more clearly, specifically regarding private sector investments.

### **c. Use of other state initiatives**

#### Strengths

- All four initiatives advance other NYS initiatives, including Start-Up NY, Hot Spots, Opportunity Agenda, Veteran’s Initiative, NY-BEST and Brownfield Redevelopment. For example, the two proposed R&D centers in the Advanced Manufacturing initiative will collaborate with Start-Up NY, while technical skills provider SUNY Broome was recently awarded SUNY 2020 funds to expand entrepreneurial training.
- Global NY would be advanced by a proposed Ultra-Premium Beverage Center in Watkins Glen that will focus on exporting ultra-premium wine.
- The revitalization plan is aligned with the NY Rising program (the URI planning process included close consultation with the storm-impacted communities), which has 14 Southern Tier communities participating in recovery from Hurricane Irene, Tropical Storm Lee (both in 2011) and the summer floods of 2013. All three communities in the Greater Binghamton Innovation Ecosystem initiative are NY Rising communities.

#### Weaknesses

- None noted.

### **d. Sustainability of investments**

#### Strengths

- The Agriculture/Food initiative has a focus on “controlled environment” agriculture, spurring year-round production and decreasing dependency on a small number of production centers. Technologies to be employed include greenhouses and hydroponics. Infrastructure and equipment will be provided by the Plant Science Innovation and Business Development Center at Cornell University.
- Funds proposed for the Innovative Culture initiative - both for tourism and innovation - will be self-sustaining. The Southern Tier Capital Fund (\$6 million), Transform Greater Binghamton Fund (\$20 million), and the Tourism Entrepreneur Incentivize Fund (\$2.5 million) will be replenished through proceeds from successful companies and repayment of loans.
- For the Advanced Manufacturing initiative, two regionally oriented research and development centers are proposed: the Center for IoT Cybersecurity and the Center for Technology Infusion. Both will focus on the design and manufacture of transportation products, components and system controls.

#### Weaknesses

- Although long-term job creation is a significant component of the plan, many of the actions are for community redevelopment or recreation, which may not lead to long-term growth.

### **e. Workforce development**

#### Strengths

- The Advanced Manufacturing initiative proposes an online job and internship repository.

- A few initiatives would provide training for potential entrepreneurs, including an Entrepreneur-in-Residence program at the SUNY Broome incubator and a higher education partnership to provide H1-B visas to foreign student/entrepreneurs.

#### Weaknesses

- Most workforce development proposals focus on hard-to-place workers and an increased focus on the underemployed might be merited.

### **f. Hard-to-place workers**

#### Strengths

- The Advanced Manufacturing initiative lists several specific activities to help hard-to-place workers, including job opportunities – especially for veterans and low-income residents - at the Advanced Rail Technology Center in Hornell.
- The Greater Binghamton initiative has multiple partners to serve hard-to-place workers, including traditional economic development partners (e.g. SUNY Broome providing technical and soft skills) and socially oriented institutions, such as the Salvation Army and the American Civic Association.
- Veterans Affairs offices would be set-up at each SUNY campus to provide assistance for veterans in the college environment.
- Raymond Corporation’s well-established employee recruitment activities focused on hard-to-place workers and will serve as a model on a regional basis.

#### Weaknesses

- None noted.

### **Plan Implementation**

#### **g. Organizational structure identified**

#### Strengths

- For each initiative an implementation structure is provided that specifies responsibilities for partners, technology development, administration, business recruitment and job creation, and workforce development.
- The revitalization plan provides a clear chart laying out URI investment amounts over five years for major investment projects.
- Budgets are provided for years 1-5 and milestones are provided for years 1-3.

#### Weaknesses

- Most responsibilities are assigned to multiple entities, without any delineation of how responsibilities would be shared.

## **h. Implementation plan and desired outcomes**

### Strengths

- Investment, jobs and economic impact are provided by year for each of the four initiatives.
- Milestones (groundbreakings and construction starts, dedications and ribbon cuttings, and announcements of game-changing projects) are provided for plan years 2016-2018.

### Weaknesses

- Although milestones are provided, the revitalization plan in general does not provide detailed implementation steps for its projects.

## **i. Performance metrics tailored to goals**

### Strengths

- Each of the four initiatives has at least 9 and as many as 16 appropriate metrics. For example, the Greater Binghamton initiative will measure job creation, reverse outmigration, commercial building façade improvements, and new rental housing units.
- The Food/Agriculture initiative will measure new greenhouses, new technologies/patents, and percent increase in food exported outside the region.
- The Innovative Culture metric will measure the increase in the “return rate” and “stay rate” of graduates of the higher education institutions in the region to see how well they are doing in attracting and retaining young talent.
- Monitoring and reporting are assigned to ESD Regional Office staff, URI administrative staff and consultants to be determined.

### Weaknesses

- Several metrics for the Advanced Manufacturing initiative involve “recognition” of the region as a leader in some technology area. While appropriate, this could be difficult to measure objectively.

## **Section III. Projects**

### **a. Projects for immediate implementation appear ready**

#### Strengths

- Over 65 “ready to go” projects are presented, support the overall strategies, and appear ready. Detail on each project is provided in Appendix 3, including sources and uses of funds and job projections.
- The STREDC emphasizes that for its ready-to-go projects, it has municipal and regulatory approvals secured, purchase agreements for property acquisition are in hand, and architectural design and preliminary engineering work is under way.
- Twenty-one of the ready-to-go projects are in the Advanced Manufacturing initiative, which is a major plan focus, with the remainder split fairly equally among the other three initiatives.

### Weaknesses

- None noted.

## **b. Conceptual projects have next steps identified**

### Strengths

- Next steps are clear for the Greater Binghamton and Advanced Manufacturing initiatives, but general in nature.

### Weaknesses

- Next steps are typically not well identified for the Food/Agriculture and Innovative Culture initiatives.

## **c. Project pipeline**

### Strengths

- A timeline and tasks are provided all four initiatives for Plan years 1-5, with many ready projects.
- The Innovative Culture initiative proposes projects like the Tourism Entrepreneur Incentive Fund and the Southern Tier Seed Venture Fund that should lead to future applications for additional projects.
- The Century Sunrise Redevelopment, formerly part of the Endicott-Johnson industrial complex, proposes to leverage a \$1.35 million URI grant against a total project cost of nearly \$30 million.

### Weaknesses

- Some tasks are rather unspecific (e.g., “Undertake small town and college town projects”).

## **Section IV. Participation**

### **a. Community outreach**

#### Strengths

- More than 975 individuals participated in 90 work group sessions, WebEx sessions, small group meetings and surveys.
- Over 100 white papers were submitted with ideas for consideration.
- More than 500 people responded to an online survey, with over 80% expressing support for each of the four initiatives.

#### Weaknesses

- The region did not document use of social media (e.g., Twitter, Facebook) aimed at a younger demographic.

## **b. Business engagement**

### Strengths

- Private sector leaders participated in the work sessions.

### Weaknesses

- Other than through membership on the REDC, there is no evidence of trade association or chambers of commerce involvement.

## **c. Engagement of local government leaders**

### Strengths

- The REDC membership includes several government officials, and was supported by a team of eleven Regional Coordinators from the counties and larger municipalities.

### Weaknesses

- Specific activities undertaken by local government leaders were not provided.

## **d. Collaboration and regional support**

### Strengths

- Several collaborations with other REDCs are proposed, including Central NY (health care), Western NY (advanced materials), and the Finger Lakes (food processing and tourism).
- The revitalization plan was researched and written by a team composed of university, economic development, and private sector partners. A strategic planner provided coordination.
- Appendix 2 provides approximately 25 letters of support from various regional stakeholders.
- Proposed inter-regional collaboration includes Binghamton University's work with SUNY Upstate Medical University (Central NY) on development of the university's proposed Center for Regenerative Medicine and BioFoundry in the Johnson City Health and Cultural iDistrict.

### Weaknesses

- None noted.

## **Section V. Performance**

### **a. Significant increase in private sector jobs projected**

#### Strengths

- The Plan proposes to create 10,241 jobs, with the most coming from the Advanced Manufacturing initiative (3,300 jobs).
- Agriculture/Food would create 2,800 jobs, the Greater Binghamton initiative would create 2,340 jobs, and Innovative Culture would create 1,800 jobs.

- There are a number of significant job creating projects, including the renovation at the Raymond Manufacturing Center of Excellence in the Village of Greene, which is projected to result in 250 jobs created and 225 jobs retained, as well as 125 construction jobs.

#### Weaknesses

- Greater detail on job specifics within the overarching figures for the four revitalization plan initiatives would be helpful.

### **b. Increase of regional wealth likely**

#### Strengths

- A total economic impact of \$3.4 billion is estimated.
- By supporting research and development capabilities of academia and industry and implementing other strategies to build an innovation ecosystem, the region hopes to attract new jobs and increase wages from an average of \$32,440 to \$40,060, and increase median household income 20%.
- The largest projected impact is for the Advanced Manufacturing initiative, at \$1.16 billion, followed by Greater Binghamton at \$913 million, Innovative Culture at \$690 million, and Agriculture/Food at \$64 million.

#### Weaknesses

- It would be helpful to have further information on the pay levels of some of the projected jobs, especially as much of the investment will be in relatively high-paying manufacturing industries.

### **c. Private sector investment expected to meet 5:1 ratio**

#### Strengths

- All four initiatives would leverage investment in at least a 5:1 ratio. Total leveraging would be \$2.5 billion, roughly 9% of the regional economy.
- Leveraging can be gauged in Appendix 3 of the report, which lists all sources, state and non-state, for the ready-to-go projects. Cash equity and local funding are commonly leveraged sources.

#### Weaknesses

- None noted.

CFA #	Region	Agency	Program Name	Project Name	Business Name	Agency Score	REDC Score	Total Score	Award	Awarded/ Not-Awarded
52951	Southern Tier	Arts	Arts CHPG I	Ithaca College Live Event Production	Ithaca College	15	20	35	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
57932	Southern Tier	Arts	Arts CHPG I	The Empire of Hops	Steuben County Conference and Visitors Bureau	12	20	32	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
56238	Southern Tier	Arts	Arts CHPG P	BrewBeats Planning	WSKG	62	15	77	\$45,553.00	Awarded
54788	Southern Tier	Arts	Arts CHPG P	Cultural Heritage Regional Plan	The ARTS Council of the Southern Finger Lakes	63	10	73	\$49,500.00	Awarded
53028	Southern Tier	Arts	Arts CHPG P	Hangar Theatre Programming for All Seasons	Center for the Arts at Ithaca Inc	29	20	49	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
55171	Southern Tier	Arts	Arts CHPG P	Exhibit and Educational Program Planning: Food as Expressions of Regional Culture	Roberson Museum and Science Center	39	5	44	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
57714	Southern Tier	Arts	Arts WIP	Expanded Management Capacity	Corning Elmira Musical Arts	65	20	85	\$24,000.00	Awarded
55033	Southern Tier	Arts	Arts WIP	Expanded Development and Outreach Capacity	Community Arts Partnership	63	20	83	\$37,254.00	Awarded
56813	Southern Tier	Arts	Arts WIP	Expanded Development Capacity	Bright Hill Press	65	15	80	\$49,500.00	Awarded
53506	Southern Tier	Arts	Arts WIP	Expanded Outreach Capacity	Historic Ithaca	63	15	78	\$49,500.00	Awarded
50462	Southern Tier	Arts	Arts WIP	Heritage Tourism in Tompkins County and the broader region	The History Center in Tompkins County	43	20	63	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
53995	Southern Tier	Arts	Arts WIP	Marketing and Event Development	Corning Painted Post Historical Society	35	15	50	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
53333	Southern Tier	Arts	Arts WIP	Trumansburg Conservatory of Fine Arts Renewal	Trumansburg Conservatory of Fine Arts	34	15	49	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
51197	Southern Tier	Arts	Arts WIP	employee ugrade	Foundation for The Open Eye	27	5	32	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
55098	Southern Tier	DEC	DEC EPG	Chemung County Sewer District No. 1 Disinfection Improvements Engineering Study	Chemung County Sewer District No. 1	76	20	96	\$16,000.00	Awarded
50989	Southern Tier	DEC	DEC EPG	City of Corning Engineering Study	City of Corning	76	20	96	\$19,600.00	Awarded
56336	Southern Tier	DEC	DEC EPG	City of Norwich Engineering Study	City of Norwich	76	20	96	\$100,000.00	Awarded
51503	Southern Tier	DEC	DEC EPG	Town of Jasper Engineering Study	Town of Jasper	76	20	96	\$30,000.00	Awarded
54254	Southern Tier	DEC	DEC EPG	Town of Owego Engineering Study	Town of Owego	72	20	92	\$30,000.00	Awarded
53001	Southern Tier	DEC	DEC EPG	Town of Reading Inflow and Infil	Barton and Loguidice, D.P.C.	34	20	54	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
53071	Southern Tier	DEC	DEC EPG	Loon Lake Wastewater Planning Grant	Town of Wayland	30	20	50	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
56422	Southern Tier	DEC	DEC WQIP AHR	Miller Ave. Culvert Replacement	Delaware County Soil and Water Conservation District	48	20	68	\$182,856.00	Awarded
55528	Southern Tier	DEC	DEC WQIP AHR	Station Road Stream Restoration	Tompkins County	26	20	46	\$246,077.00	Awarded
52848	Southern Tier	DEC	DEC WQIP MS4	Tompkins County MS4 Mapping Project	Tompkins County Soil and Water Conservation District	45	20	65	\$59,750.00	Awarded
50447	Southern Tier	DEC	DEC WQIP NSAC	Schuyler County Stream and Road Ditch Stabilization	Schuyler County Soil and Water Conservation District	55	20	75	\$350,000.00	Awarded
57432	Southern Tier	DEC	DEC WQIP NSAC	Schuyler County Stormwater BMP Implementation and Education	Schuyler County Soil and Water Conservation District	45	20	65	\$20,000.00	Awarded
56225	Southern Tier	DEC	DEC WQIP NSAC	Tompkins County Hydroseeding Program	Tompkins County Soil and Water Conservation District	45	20	65	\$125,225.00	Awarded
56075	Southern Tier	DEC	DEC WQIP NSAC	Upper Susquehanna Coalition Emergency Stream Intervention Program	Tioga County Soil and Water Conservation District	45	20	65	\$150,000.00	Awarded
57685	Southern Tier	DEC	DEC WQIP NSAC	Catharine Creek and Seneca Lake Watersheds Sediment and Nutrient Reduction Project	Schuyler County Soil and Water Conservation District	43	20	63	\$170,000.00	Awarded
54715	Southern Tier	DEC	DEC WQIP NSAC	Compost Based Stormwater Best Management Practices - Tompkins County	Tompkins County Soil and Water Conservation District	43	20	63	\$77,700.00	Awarded
55942	Southern Tier	DEC	DEC WQIP NSAC	South Street Bank Restoration Project	Delaware County Soil and Water Conservation District	38	20	58	\$763,728.00	Awarded



CFA #	Region	Agency	Program Name	Project Name	Business Name	Agency Score	REDC Score	Total Score	Award	Awarded/ Not-Awarded
53251	Southern Tier	DEC	DEC WQIP NSAC	Upper Delaware River Tailwaters Coalition Stream Restoration	Delaware County	20	20	40	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
55424	Southern Tier	DEC	DEC WQIP NSAC	South Street Extension Escarpment	County of Tompkins	18	20	38	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
55559	Southern Tier	DEC	DEC WQIP NSAC	Water Street Phase 1	Delaware County Soil and Water Conservation District	18	20	38	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
55096	Southern Tier	DEC	DEC WQIP WTID	Chemung Wastewater Disinfection Project	Chemung County	61	20	81	\$2,500,000.00	Awarded
53485	Southern Tier	DEC	DEC WQIP WTI	Village of South Corning Water Project	Village of South Corning	56	20	76	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
56948	Southern Tier	DEC	DEC WQIP WTI	Watkins Glen WWTP Improvements	Village of Watkins Glen	41	20	61	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
53463	Southern Tier	DEC	DEC WQIP WTI	Village of Montour Falls Water System	Village of Montour Falls	23	20	43	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
53008	Southern Tier	DEC	DEC WQIP WTI	Wastewater Collection System Rehabilitation	Village of Addison	21	20	41	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
57057	Southern Tier	DEC	DEC WQIP WTI	Tioga County IDA Wastewater Treatment Plant Expansion	Tioga County Industrial Development Agency	16	20	36	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
51946	Southern Tier	DEC	DEC WQIP WTI	Town of Nichols Wastewater Treatment Plant Improvements	Town of Nichols	16	20	36	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
57436	Southern Tier	DOL	DOL EET	Lean Manufacturing Training	Precision Filters, Inc.	44.7	20	64.7	\$37,625.00	Awarded
56665	Southern Tier	DOL	DOL EET	Software Training	Johnson-Schmidt, Architect, P.C.	44.68	20	64.68	\$25,000.00	Awarded
54458	Southern Tier	DOL	DOL EET	Enterprise Resource Planning Training	Engineering Manufacturing Technologies, LLC	46.39	0	46.39	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
55649	Southern Tier	DOL	DOL NHT	Transportation Management Training	Tri-Bros Transportation, L.L.C.	61.5	15	76.5	\$99,680.00	Awarded
56572	Southern Tier	DOL	DOL UWT	Manufacturing Basics Training	Broome Community College	35.63	20	55.63	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
56455	Southern Tier	DOS	DOS LWRP	Chugnut Trail Extension Design	Town of Union	68.8	20	88.8	\$75,000.00	Awarded
53008	Southern Tier	DOS	DOS LWRP	Waterfront Revitalization Plan	Village of Addison	68.8	20	88.8	\$13,505.00	Awarded
52781	Southern Tier	DOS	DOS LWRP	Cayuga Lake Blueway Trail Implementation	Tompkins County	68	20	88	\$101,245.00	Awarded
52954	Southern Tier	DOS	DOS LWRP	Kirkside Park Improvements	Town of Roxbury	67.2	20	87.2	\$135,000.00	Awarded
51179	Southern Tier	DOS	DOS LWRP	Local Flood Hazard Analysis	City of Ithaca	66.4	20	86.4	\$150,000.00	Awarded
52439	Southern Tier	DOS	DOS LWRP	Local Waterfront Revitalization Program Update	City of Binghamton	65.6	20	85.6	\$50,000.00	Awarded
51428	Southern Tier	DOS	DOS LWRP	River Park and Walk	Village of Delhi	64	20	84	\$107,666.00	Awarded
52825	Southern Tier	DOS	DOS LWRP	Watson Boulevard Levee Extension Gate	Town of Union	55.2	15	70.2	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
54616	Southern Tier	EFC	EFC GIGP	Cornell Green Parking and Outreach	Cornell University	55	20	75	\$362,468.00	Awarded
50973	Southern Tier	EFC	EFC GIGP	City Center Lofts Green Roof	Keystone Associates Architects Engineers and Surveyors, LLC	43	20	63	\$284,400.00	Awarded
51578	Southern Tier	EFC	EFC GIGP	Keystone Associates Green Roof Rainwater Harvesting	Keystone Associates Architects Engineers and Surveyors, LLC	34	20	54	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
55879	Southern Tier	EFC	EFC GIGP	Oakdale Crossings Green Redevelopment	Crux Properties, LLC	44	10	54	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
51758	Southern Tier	EFC	EFC GIGP	Kopernik Science Center	Kopernik Observatory and Science Center	32	20	52	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
55068	Southern Tier	EFC	EFC GIGP	The Cayuga Inlet Floodplain Restoration	Tompkins County	30	20	50	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
57944	Southern Tier	EFC	EFC GIGP	Permeable Parking Area	Village of Windsor	23	20	43	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
51618	Southern Tier	EFC	EFC GIGP	Chenango Forks Central School District	Keystone Associates Architects Engineers and Surveyors, LLC	30	10	40	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
57166	Southern Tier	EFC	EFC GIGP	Water Street Flood Mitigation	Village of Walton	18	20	38	\$0.00	Not-Awarded

CFA #	Region	Agency	Program Name	Project Name	Business Name	Agency Score	REDC Score	Total Score	Award	Awarded/ Not-Awarded
56702	Southern Tier	ESD	ESD BISP	Rev Ithaca NYS Certified Business Incubator	Rev Ithaca Startup Works	71.25	20	91.25	\$125,000.00	Awarded
56460	Southern Tier	ESD	ESD BISP	IncubatorWorks NYS Certified Business Incubator	Alfred Technology Resources Inc DBA IncubatorWorks	64.75	20	84.75	\$125,000.00	Awarded
51702	Southern Tier	ESD	ESD BISP	Kevin M McGovern Family Center For Venture Development in the Life Sciences	Cornell University	64.25	15	79.25	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
55779	Southern Tier	URI	URI	7 Hawley Street Redevelopment	Binghamton Urban Renewal Agency	74	20	94	\$3,450,000.00	Awarded
55934	Southern Tier	URI	URI	Elmira College Driving Elmira Refresh	Elmira College	73	20	93	\$1,500,000.00	Awarded
50680	Southern Tier	URI	URI	Corning Health Education Complex	Corning Community College Development Foundation, Inc.	73	20	93	\$3,500,000.00	Awarded
56729	Southern Tier	URI	URI	Upstate Shredding Media Plant	Upstate Shredding, LLC	72	20	92	\$1,000,000.00	Awarded
55817	Southern Tier	URI	URI	CMD Consolidation Expansion	Cameron Manufacturing Design	72	20	92	\$400,000.00	Awarded
54724	Southern Tier	URI	URI	Transit Air Capital	Transitair, Inc.	72	20	92	\$150,000.00	Awarded
55881	Southern Tier	URI	URI	3D Metrology	Incodema3D LLC	71	20	91	\$375,000.00	Awarded
52779	Southern Tier	URI	URI	DeMets Candy Company	DeMet's Candy Company	71	20	91	\$1,800,000.00	Awarded
52429	Southern Tier	URI	URI	Anchor Glass Modernization Project	Anchor Glass Container Corporation	71	20	91	\$1,330,000.00	Awarded
52533	Southern Tier	URI	URI	The Werdenberg Building Project	Envision Elmira LLC	70	20	90	\$120,000.00	Awarded
51449	Southern Tier	URI	URI	The Roxbury at Stratton Falls	Masserson Holdings LLC	70	20	90	\$1,330,000.00	Awarded
57280	Southern Tier	URI	URI	Building Innovative Economic Opportunities through Reuse	Finger Lakes ReUse, Inc.	69	20	89	\$500,000.00	Awarded
55259	Southern Tier	URI	URI	Bates Troy Expansion	Bates Troy Incorporated	69	20	89	\$600,000.00	Awarded
54614	Southern Tier	URI	URI	Ice Bear Capital	Ice Energy Holdings Inc	69	20	89	\$400,000.00	Awarded
53761	Southern Tier	URI	URI	Block Bindings Capital	Simaar, Inc.	69	20	89	\$200,000.00	Awarded
53015	Southern Tier	URI	URI	Chenango Gas	Leatherstocking Gas, LLC	69	20	89	\$1,500,000.00	Awarded
51917	Southern Tier	URI	URI	Buckingham Manufacturing Modernization Project	Buckingham MfgCo	69	20	89	\$45,000.00	Awarded
50517	Southern Tier	URI	URI	Chicone Cabinetmaker Capital	Chicone Cabinetmakers, LLC	69	20	89	\$150,000.00	Awarded
55195	Southern Tier	URI	URI	City of Ithaca College Town Redevelopment	City of Ithaca	68	20	88	\$1,000,000.00	Awarded
53650	Southern Tier	URI	URI	Century Sunrise Redevelopment Capital	Regan Development Corporation	68	20	88	\$1,000,000.00	Awarded
53534	Southern Tier	URI	URI	Ithaca Beer Capital	The Ithaca Beer Company, Inc.	68	20	88	\$175,000.00	Awarded
53039	Southern Tier	URI	URI	Town of Urbana Waterfront Capital	Town of Urbana	68	20	88	\$350,000.00	Awarded
52628	Southern Tier	URI	URI	Village of Waverly WWTP Upgrade	Village of Waverly	68	20	88	\$2,000,000.00	Awarded
52319	Southern Tier	URI	URI	Walton WWTP Biogas Project	Village of Walton	68	20	88	\$1,500,000.00	Awarded
52170	Southern Tier	URI	URI	Hopshire Brewery Expansion	Hopshire Brewery, LLC	68	20	88	\$50,000.00	Awarded
55707	Southern Tier	URI	URI	National Pipe Plastics Relocation	National Pipe and Plastics, Inc.	67	20	87	\$500,000.00	Awarded
55298	Southern Tier	URI	URI	Lackawanna train station	Loco Development LLC	67	20	87	\$75,000.00	Awarded
54894	Southern Tier	URI	URI	Finger Lakes Boating Museum Capital	Finger Lakes Boating Museum	67	20	87	\$50,000.00	Awarded
53297	Southern Tier	URI	URI	NECCES Battery Dry Room	Binghamton University SUNY	67	20	87	\$600,000.00	Awarded
58058	Southern Tier	URI	URI	Renovation of 48 Corliss Avenue at the Southern Tier Health Sciences and Technology Innovation Park	Binghamton University State Univeristy of New York	66	20	86	\$2,000,000.00	Awarded
55901	Southern Tier	URI	URI	Raymond Manufacturing Center of Excellence	The Raymond Corporation	67	15	82	\$500,000.00	Awarded
53866	Southern Tier	URI	URI	Arnot Ogden Medical Capital	Arnot Ogden Medical Center	66	15	81	\$1,500,000.00	Awarded

CFA #	Region	Agency	Program Name	Project Name	Business Name	Agency Score	REDC Score	Total Score	Award	Awarded/ Not-Awarded
50694	Southern Tier	URI	URI	Tioga County IDA E-Site Water System	Tioga County Department of Economic Development and Planning	66	15	81	\$350,000.00	Awarded
57442	Southern Tier	URI	URI	Transform Greater Binghamton Fund	The Agency - Broome County IDA / LDC	59	20	79	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
54128	Southern Tier	URI	URI	Goodwill Theatre	Goodwill Theatre Inc.	59	20	79	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
51612	Southern Tier	URI	URI	Norwich Best Western	JEGG Realty Norwich LLC	59	20	79	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
55028	Southern Tier	URI	URI	JC Health Technology Park	The Agency - Broome County IDA / LDC	58	20	78	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
57361	Southern Tier	URI	URI	Elmira Corning Regional Airport Improvements	County of Chemung	61	15	76	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
57695	Southern Tier	URI	URI	Tioga County IDA Water/Sewer Capital	Tioga County IDA	59	15	74	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
52825	Southern Tier	URI	URI	Fairmont Park Capital	Town of Union	59	15	74	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
56110	Southern Tier	URI	URI	MAKERSPACE DEVELOPING INNOVATION INNOVATORS	IncubatorWorks	55	15	70	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
50762	Southern Tier	URI	URI	One North Depot Capital	One North Depot, LLC	54	15	69	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
56258	Southern Tier	URI	URI	Harolds Square Downtown Ithaca	L Enterprises LLC	53	15	68	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
56710	Southern Tier	URI	URI	Southern Finger Lakes Conference and Event Center	L Enterprises LLC	49	15	64	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
56704	Southern Tier	URI	URI	Capital Fund	Southern Tier Startup Alliance	43	20	63	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
55784	Southern Tier	URI	URI	STREDC Small Manufacturing Competitiveness Fund	Southern Tier Region Economic Development Corporation	48	15	63	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
54592	Southern Tier	URI	URI	STREDC Rural Initiative Fund	outhern Tier Region Economic Development Corporation	48	15	63	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
52915	Southern Tier	URI	URI	STREDC Community Revitalization Program	Southern Tier Region Economic Development Corporation	48	15	63	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
54872	Southern Tier	URI	URI	Oxford WSI Capital	Village of Oxford	51	10	61	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
50915	Southern Tier	URI	URI	Southern Tier East Grains to Growers	Southern Tier East Regional Planning Development Board	46	15	61	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
53472	Southern Tier	URI	URI	Newark Valley Solar Capital	Village of Newark Valley	49	10	59	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
54569	Southern Tier	URI	URI	The Salvation Army Job Training Center	The Salvation Army	42	15	57	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
55680	Southern Tier	URI	URI	CHESS Upgrade - ESD	Cornell University	41	15	56	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
54641	Southern Tier	URI	URI	Hanford Mills Museum Capital	The Hanford Mills Museum at East Meredith, Inc.	46	10	56	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
51518	Southern Tier	URI	URI	Curtiss Museum Expansion	The Glenn H. Curtiss Museum	40	15	55	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
50616	Southern Tier	URI	URI	Natural Gardens Farm Wedding and Event Destination	Natural Gardens LLC	40	15	55	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
56433	Southern Tier	URI	URI	Roberson Gallery Expansion and Kitchen Renovation	Roberson Museum and Science Center	46	5	51	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
55770	Southern Tier	URI	URI	Deap Sea Gas	Advanced Design Consulting USA Inc	43	5	48	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
55431	Southern Tier	URI	URI	STREDC Shovel Ready Program	Southern Tier Region Economic Development Corporation	48	0	48	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
54458	Southern Tier	URI	URI	EMT Capital	Engineering Manufacturing Technologies LLC	47	0	47	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
57268	Southern Tier	URI	URI	Watson Homestead Swimming Pool Revitalization	Watson Homestead Conference and Retreat Center, Inc.	41	5	46	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
52810	Southern Tier	URI	URI	Empire State Development Grant Funds	Engineering Manufacturing Technologies, LLC	40	0	40	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
51743	Southern Tier	URI	URI	Lightweight Hybrid Bus Manufacturing	Light Green Machines LLC	30	10	40	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
56253	Southern Tier	ESD	ESD MNY	Binghamton Culinary Tourism Alliance	eatBING Inc	63.67	20	83.67	\$58,800.00	Awarded

CFA #	Region	Agency	Program Name	Project Name	Business Name	Agency Score	REDC Score	Total Score	Award	Awarded/ Not-Awarded
51612	Southern Tier	ESD	ESD MNY	Norwich Best Western	JEGG Realty Norwich LLC	62	20	82	\$239,840.00	Awarded
56845	Southern Tier	ESD	ESD MNY	Spiediefest 2016	Spiedie Fest Balloon Rally Expo, Inc.	56.33	20	76.33	\$37,500.00	Awarded
52644	Southern Tier	ESD	ESD MNY	Tompkins County Wayfinding Interpretive Signage Project	Tompkins County Chamber of Commerce Foundation	50.33	20	70.33	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
57192	Southern Tier	ESD	ESD MNY	Delaware County Arts Promotion	Roxbury Arts Group	49.33	20	69.33	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
56211	Southern Tier	ESD	ESD MNY	Ithaca/Tompkins Convention and Visitors Bureau Mobile Technology Initiative, Phase II	Ithaca/Tompkins County Convention and Visitors Bureau	54.33	15	69.33	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
54902	Southern Tier	ESD	ESD MNY	Ride the Catskills Marketing Campaign	Catskill Association for Tourism Services	49.33	20	69.33	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
40029	Southern Tier	ESD	ESD MNY	Sciencenter Project	Sciencenter Discovery Museum	48	20	68	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
53038	Southern Tier	ESD	ESD MNY	Hangar Theatre Rebranding as the Center for the Arts at Ithaca	Hangar Theatre	50	15	65	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
56725	Southern Tier	ESD	ESD MNY	Tioga County Regional Tourism Marketing Campaign	Tioga County Local Development Corporation	46	15	61	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
50616	Southern Tier	ESD	ESD MNY	Natural Gardens Farm Wedding and Event Destination	The Natural Gardens LLC	45.33	15	60.33	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
54641	Southern Tier	ESD	ESD MNY	Building a Working Reproduction of the Mill's Horizontal Steam Engine	The Hanford Mills Museum at East Meredith, Inc.	46.33	10	56.33	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
50915	Southern Tier	ESD	ESD MNY	Grains to Growlers	Southern Tier East Regional Planning Development Board	39.33	15	54.33	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
53461	Southern Tier	ESD	ESD SPFS	Elmira Road Corridor Capital	Town of Ithaca	66	20	86	\$30,000.00	Awarded
56093	Southern Tier	ESD	ESD SPFS	City of Corning Economic Development Strategy	City of Corning	65	20	85	\$24,000.00	Awarded
55139	Southern Tier	ESD	ESD SPFS	Endicott iDistrict Revitalization Plan	Broome County Department of Planning and Economic Development	61	15	76	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
54863	Southern Tier	ESD	ESD SPFS	City of Binghamton Parks Department Master Plan	City of Binghamton	48	15	63	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
50915	Southern Tier	ESD	ESD SPFS	Southern Tier East Grains to Growlers	Southern Tier East Regional Planning Development Board	46	15	61	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
51364	Southern Tier	HCR	HCR CDBGCP	Town of Campbell Water District Study	Town of Campbell	74.5	20	94.5	\$45,000.00	Awarded
53455	Southern Tier	HCR	HCR CDBGCP	Village of Candor Drinking Water Project	Village of Candor	51.76	20	71.76	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
55592	Southern Tier	HCR	HCR CDBGCP	Village of Hancock Engineering Report	Village of Hancock	43.39	20	63.39	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
52704	Southern Tier	HCR	HCR CDBGME	Delaware County Microenterprise Program	Delaware County	59	20	79	\$200,000.00	Awarded
52370	Southern Tier	HCR	HCR CDBGPF	City of Corning Lamphear Court Road Improvements	City of Corning	51.87	20	71.87	\$600,000.00	Awarded
54748	Southern Tier	HCR	HCR CDBGPI	Village of Sidney Riverlea Project	Village of Sidney	46.32	20	66.32	\$600,000.00	Awarded
55679	Southern Tier	HCR	HCR CDBGPI	City of Hornell Sanitary Sewer Rehabilitation	City of Hornell	43.91	20	63.91	\$585,000.00	Awarded
50138	Southern Tier	HCR	HCR CDBGPI	Village of Stamford Water System Improvements	Village of Stamford	44.97	15	59.97	\$500,000.00	Awarded
53463	Southern Tier	HCR	HCR CDBGPI	Village of Montour Falls Sanitary Sewer Improvements	Village of Montour Falls	38.54	20	58.54	\$600,000.00	Awarded
53163	Southern Tier	HCR	HCR CDBGPI	Village of Deposit Water System Improvements	Village of Deposit	35.64	20	55.64	\$599,935.00	Awarded
55194	Southern Tier	HCR	HCR CDBGPI	Village of Groton Storm water Improvement Program	Village of Groton	35.16	20	55.16	\$471,679.00	Awarded
53178	Southern Tier	HCR	HCR CDBGPI	Broome County Forest View Mobile Home Park WWTP	Broome County	34.3	20	54.3	\$127,000.00	Awarded
51281	Southern Tier	HCR	HCR NYMS	Rehabilitation of 115-117 N Cayuga St	Downtown Ithaca Alliance	69	15	84	\$500,000.00	Awarded
50635	Southern Tier	HCR	HCR NYMS	Waverly Downtown Revitalization Program	Tioga County	61	20	81	\$300,000.00	Awarded
53144	Southern Tier	HCR	HCR NYMS	Corning's Gaffer District Building Renovation 2015	Corning Intown District Management Association, Inc.	54	20	74	\$215,000.00	Awarded

CFA #	Region	Agency	Program Name	Project Name	Business Name	Agency Score	REDC Score	Total Score	Award	Awarded/ Not-Awarded
55340	Southern Tier	HCR	HCR NYMS	Village of Windsor Revitalization	Village of Windsor	53	20	73	\$220,166.00	Awarded
52723	Southern Tier	HCR	HCR NYMS	Village of Horseheads NYMS Program	Community Progress Inc	49	20	69	\$165,120.00	Awarded
50820	Southern Tier	HCR	HCR NYMS	Regional Main Street Program	The MARK Project	48	20	68	\$300,000.00	Awarded
52329	Southern Tier	HCR	HCR NYMS	Hammondsport Core Business District Project	Hammondsport Chamber of Commerce	46	20	66	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
56530	Southern Tier	HCR	HCR NYMS	Downsville New York Main Street Program	Town of Colchester	45	20	65	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
54168	Southern Tier	HCR	HCR NYMS	2015 Norwich Downtown Revitalization Program	City of Norwich	42	15	57	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
54128	Southern Tier	HCR	HCR NYMS	Cultural Anchor of Johnson City Health Cultural Innovation District	goodwill theatre inc	36	20	56	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
57437	Southern Tier	HCR	HCR NYMS	Delhi Village NYMS	Village of Delhi	44	10	54	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
54098	Southern Tier	HCR	HCR NYMS	200 West Water Street - The Werdenberg	Elmira Downtown Development Inc	32	20	52	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
57411	Southern Tier	HCR	HCR NYMS	Hornell Downtown Transformation Initiative	City of Hornell	28	20	48	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
52371	Southern Tier	HCR	HCR NYMS-TA	Village of Bath Main Street Technical Assistance	Village of Bath	40	20	60	\$20,000.00	Awarded
55811	Southern Tier	NYSERDA	NYSERDA CGC3	NY Community Project	EV Connect	74.15	15	89.15	\$257,143.00	Awarded
55124	Southern Tier	NYSERDA	NYSERDA CGC3	Chain Works District Emerson Redevelopment Phase 1	Unchained Properties LLC	67.3	20	87.3	\$1,500,000.00	Awarded
52863	Southern Tier	NYSERDA	NYSERDA CGC3	210 Hancock	Ithaca Neighborhood Housing Services	60.3	20	80.3	\$516,674.00	Awarded
55181	Southern Tier	NYSERDA	NYSERDA CGC3	Tompkins County Electric Vehicle Market Transformation	Tompkins County	54.57	20	74.57	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
52369	Southern Tier	NYSERDA	NYSERDA CGC3	Lamphear Court Phase II Neighborhood Redevelopment	Arbor Housing and Development	51.18	20	71.18	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
55143	Southern Tier	NYSERDA	NYSERDA CGC3	Bethany Senior Living	Fagan Engineers Land Surveyors PC	51.48	15	66.48	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
54795	Southern Tier	NYSERDA	NYSERDA CGC3	Town of Union LED Street Light Replacement Project	Town of Union	39.35	20	59.35	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
50449	Southern Tier	NYSERDA	NYSERDA CGC3	Route 434 Greenway Construction Project	City of Binghamton	42.77	15	57.77	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
52235	Southern Tier	NYSERDA	NYSERDA CGC3	TIGER FY 2015 Grant	City of Ithaca	36.92	20	56.92	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
54128	Southern Tier	Parks	OPRHP HAS D	Cultural Anchor of Johnson City Health Cultural Innovation District	Goodwill Theatre, Inc.	50	20	70	\$500,000.00	Awarded
51614	Southern Tier	Parks	OPRHP HAS D/P	Building Brick Repair	West Endicott Fire District	35	10	45	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
55034	Southern Tier	Parks	OPRHP HAS P	Government Plaza Planning and Design	Broome County	42.5	15	57.5	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
54128	Southern Tier	Parks	OPRHP HP D	Cultural Anchor of Johnson City Health Cultural Innovation District	goodwill theatre inc	48	20	68	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
54613	Southern Tier	Parks	OPRHP HP D	Save the Sherburne Inn Restoration Project Inc SSIRP	Save the Sherburne Inn Restoration Project Inc SSIRP	38.5	20	58.5	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
51805	Southern Tier	Parks	OPRHP HP D	Gould Church Restoration Project	Jay Gould Memorial Reformed Church	34.5	20	54.5	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
52710	Southern Tier	Parks	OPRHP HP D/P	City of Binghamton Historic Carousel Restoration	City of Binghamton	45.5	20	65.5	\$500,000.00	Awarded
51614	Southern Tier	Parks	OPRHP HP D/P	Building Brick Repair	West Endicott Fire District	42	10	52	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
53333	Southern Tier	Parks	OPRHP HP P	Trumansburg Conservatory of Fine Arts Renewal	Trumansburg Conservatory of Fine Arts	44.5	15	59.5	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
51758	Southern Tier	Parks	OPRHP PKS D	Kopernik Science Center	Kopernik Society of Broome County	59	20	79	\$200,000.00	Awarded
50424	Southern Tier	Parks	OPRHP PKS D	Boat Ramp Upgrades 2015	Village of Sidney	49	20	69	\$40,856.00	Awarded
54348	Southern Tier	Parks	OPRHP PKS D	Town of Ithaca Playground Replacements	Town of Ithaca	55	10	65	\$48,000.00	Awarded
51200	Southern Tier	Parks	OPRHP PKS D	Restroom Study for Village Green	Village of Bainbridge	40	10	50	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
54625	Southern Tier	Parks	OPRHP PKS D	Montgomery Park Rehabilitation	Village of Dryden	31.5	10	41.5	\$0.00	Not-Awarded

CFA #	Region	Agency	Program Name	Project Name	Business Name	Agency Score	REDC Score	Total Score	Award	Awarded/ Not-Awarded
50658	Southern Tier	Parks	OPRHP PKS D	Municipal Pool Complex Reconstruction	Village of Sidney	35	5	40	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
56112	Southern Tier	Parks	OPRHP PKS D	Goodwin Park Solar LED Trail Lighting - 2015	Town of Southport	25.5	10	35.5	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
55197	Southern Tier	Parks	OPRHP PKS D	OPRHP EPF Municipal FY 2015 Grant	City of Ithaca	8.5	20	28.5	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
51249	Southern Tier	Parks	OPRHP PKS D/P	Nasser Civic Center Ice Rink	City of Corning Parks and Recreation	44	20	64	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
52373	Southern Tier	Parks	OPRHP PKS D/P	Campbell Town Park Improvements	Town of Campbell	51	10	61	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
52710	Southern Tier	Parks	OPRHP PKS D/P	City of Binghamton Historic Carousel Restoration	City of Binghamton	27.5	20	47.5	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
57945	Southern Tier	Parks	OPRHP PKS D/P	Town of Southport - Chapel Park Wilderness Trail 2015	Fagan Engineers Land Surveyors, PC	25	20	45	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
50428	Southern Tier	Parks	OPRHP PKS D/P	East Sidney Lake Campground	Town of Sidney	31.5	5	36.5	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
51428	Southern Tier	Parks	OPRHP RTP	Village of Delhi River Park and Walk	Village of Delhi	39	20	59	\$163,862.00	Awarded
57945	Southern Tier	Parks	OPRHP RTP	Town of Southport - Chapel Park Wilderness Trail 2015	Fagan Engineers Land Surveyors, PC	20.5	20	40.5	\$0.00	Not-Awarded
56112	Southern Tier	Parks	OPRHP RTP	Goodwin Park Solar LED Trail Lighting - 2015	Town of Southport	25	10	35	\$0.00	Not-Awarded

# 2015 Program Legend

Agency	Abbreviation	Program Name
Arts	Arts CHPG I	Arts, Culture, Heritage New Initiatives - Implementation
Arts	Arts CHPG P	Arts, Culture, Heritage New Initiatives - Planning
Arts	Arts WIP	Workforce Investment
Canals	Canals	Canalway Grant Program
DEC	DEC EPG	Engineering Planning Grant
DEC	DEC WQIP AHR	Water Quality Improvement Project - Aquatic Habitat Restoration
DEC	DEC WQIP MS4	Water Quality Improvement Project - Municipal Separate Storm Sewer Systems
DEC	DEC WQIP NSAC	Water Quality Improvement Program - Non-agricultural Nonpoint Source Abatement and Control
DEC	DEC WQIP WTI	Water Quality Improvement Program - Wastewater Treatment Improvement
DEC	DEC WQIP WTID	Water Quality Improvement Program - Wastewater Treatment Improvement Disinfection
DOL	DOL EET	Existing Employee Training
DOL	DOL NHT	New Hire Training
DOL	DOL SPTP	Special Populations Training
DOL	DOL UWT	Unemployed Worker Training
DOS	DOS LGE	Local Government Efficiency Program
DOS	DOS LGE P	Local Government Efficiency Program - Planning
DOS	DOS LWRP	Local Waterfront Revitalization Program
EFC	EFC GIGP	Green Innovation Grant Program
ESD	ESD BISP	Business Incubator Support Program
ESD	ESD EJP	Excelsior Jobs Program
ESD	ESD Grants	Empire State Development Grant Program
ESD	ESD MNY	Market New York
ESD	ESD SPFS	Strategic Planning and Feasibility Studies
HCR	HCR CDBGCP	Community Development Block Grant - Community Planning
HCR	HCR CDBGME	Community Development Block Grant - Microenterprise
HCR	HCR CDBGPF	Community Development Block Grant - Public Facilities
HCR	HCR CDBGPI	Community Development Block Grant - Public Infrastructure
HCR	HCR NYMS	New York Main Street
HCR	HCR NYMS-TA	New York Main Street Technical Assistance
NYSERDA	NYSERDA CGC3	Cleaner Greener Communities
OPRHP	OPRHP HAS D	Heritage Area Systems (Development)
OPRHP	OPRHP HP D	Historic Property (Development)
OPRHP	OPRHP HP D/P	Historic Property (Development & Planning)
OPRHP	OPRHP HP P	Historic Property (Planning)
OPRHP	OPRHP PKS A	Parks (Acquisition)
OPRHP	OPRHP PKS A/D	Parks (Acquisition & Development)
OPRHP	OPRHP PKS D	Parks (Development)
OPRHP	OPRHP PKS D/A	Parks (Development & Acquisition)
OPRHP	OPRHP PKS D/P	Parks (Development & Planning)
OPRHP	OPRHP PKS P	Parks (Planning)
OPRHP	OPRHP RTP D	Recreational Trails Program
URI	URI	Upstate Revitalization Initiative