

**OPEN FOR BUSINESS:
A NEW STATE GOVERNMENT APPROACH TO ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT
New York City Regional Economic Development Council: Public Forum
Tuesday, October 25, 2011
Hostos Community College/CUNY, Bronx**

Forum Summary

Attendees:

Hon. Robert Duffy, Lieutenant Governor

Regional Council Members and Representatives

Matthew Goldstein, Chancellor, The City University of New York (co-chair), w/ Jay Hershenson
Stuart Appelbaum, President, Retail, Wholesale and Department Store Union, w/Ademola Oyefeso and
Zayne Abdessalam

Marlene Cintron, President, Bronx Overall Economic Development Corporation, w/ Frank Randazo

Cesar J. Claro, President & CEO, Staten Island Economic Development Corporation

Carol Conslato, President, Queens Chamber of Commerce

Shaneequa Owuso, representing Francine Y. Delgado, Seedco

Mike Fishman, 32BJ SEIU, w/ Amy Sugimori

Gail Grimmett, Delta Airlines

Josh Gold, representing Peter Ward, Hotel & Motel Trades Council

Steve Hindy, President, Brooklyn Brewery

Carl Hum, President & CEO, Brooklyn Chamber of Commerce

Kenneth Knuckles, President & CEO, Upper Manhattan Empowerment Zone Development Corporation

Michael Hurwitz, representing Marcel Van Ooyen, Grow NYC

Gary LaBarbera, NYC Buildings and Construction Trades, President, w/ Heather Beaudoin

Nick Lugo, President, Hispanic Chamber of Commerce, w/ Peter Spinella

Dr. Alfred Ntoko , representing Marcia V. Keizs, President, York College, CUNY

Steve Spinola, President, Real Estate Board of New York

Douglas C. Steiner, Steiner Studios

Sheena Wright, President & CEO, Abyssinian Development Corporation

Kathryn Wylde, President & CEO, Partnership for New York City

Elected Officials & Representatives (City)

Jason Razefsky and Joseph Sciortino, representing Hon. James Molinaro, Staten Island Borough President

Hon. Ruben Diaz, Jr., Bronx Borough President, w/ Raymond Sanchez and Wilhelm Ronda

John Bittner, representing Hon. Helen Marshall, Queens Borough President

Thomas B. Donaldson, representing Hon. Christine Quinn, Speaker of the NYC City Council

Sara Valenzuela, representing Hon. Scott Stringer, Manhattan Borough President

Andrew Steininger, representing Hon. Marty Markowitz, Brooklyn Borough President

Hon. Diana Reyna, Member, City Council, w/ Peter Pottier and Malcolm Sanborn-Hum

Dustin Engelken, representing Hon. Annabel Palma, Member, City Council

Cleveland E. Beckett, Jr., representing Hon. Larry Seabrook, Member, City Council

Elected Officials & Representatives (State)

Hon. Jose Rivera, NYS Assembly Member

Hon. Marcos Crespo, NYS Assembly Member
Hon. Nelson Castro, NYS Assembly Member
Hon. Michael Benedetto, NYS Assembly Member
Hon. Gustavo Rivera, NYS Senator, w/ Maryann Rosa
Edu Hermelyn, representing Hon. Vanessa L. Gibson, Member, NYS Assembly
Isamari Puello, representing Hon. Carl Heastie, Member, NYS Assembly
Cheryl Simmons-Oliver, representing Hon. Jose Serrano, NYS Serrano

New York City Mayor's Office

Tokumbo Shobowale, representing Hon. Robert Steel, New York City Deputy Mayor

Regional Council Staff & ESD

Joseph Tazewell, NYC Regional Director, ESD
Tara Brooks-Smith, Facilitator, NYS Dept. of Labor
Nydia Loyd, NYS Dept. of Labor
Marion Phillips, Facilitator, ESD
John Moye, DOL
Andrew Fletcher, ESD
Ingrid Nathan, ESD
Jim Brown, DOL
Curtis Cravens, DOS
Justin Ginsburgh, ESD
Maisha Lopa, Intern, ESD
David Weinberger, Intern, ESD
Austin Shafran, ESD
Antonio Rodriguez, ESD

Executive Chamber Representatives

Robert Duffy, Lieutenant Governor
Irene Baker, Executive Vice President, Director of Regional Councils
Rodney Capel, Governor's Office
Zach Greenky, Special Assistant, Governor's Office

State Resource Team

Kiumars Amiri, NYSERDA
Wayne Benjamin, NYS DMV
Sobeida Cruz, NYS Power Authority
Phillip Eng, DOT
Rachel Gordon, OPRHP
Sharon Griffith, NYSERDA
Ellen Poliski, DOH
Gregory Watson, NYSHCS
Michael Weber, DHCR
Jay-E Emmingham, NYSERDA
Alyssa Rothe, NYSERDA
Phil Giltner, NYS Dept. of Agriculture and Markets

Hostos Community College

Dr. Felix V. Matos-Rodriguez, President, Hostos Community College
Lorraine Altman, Hostos
Deborah Reid, Hostos
Corwin Spivey, Hostos
Denyse Procope-Gregoire, Hostos

CUNY

Jay Hershenson, Senior Vice Chancellor for University Relations & Board Secretary, CUNY
Dr. Suri Duitch, University Associate Dean for Continuing Education, CUNY
Amanda Daly, Director of Green Education and Training Programs, CUNY
Howard Apsan, University Director, Environmental Health and Safety, CUNY
Hourig Messerlian, CUNY
Anthony Vargas, CUNY
Shanequa Terry, CUNY
Theresa Desmond, CUNY
Nancy Ruhling, CUNY

Public

Paulette Enriquez, Lehman College
Justin Rodgers, Greater Jamaica Development Corp.
Clarence Stanley, Lehman College Small Business Development
Marlin Jenkins, Mid-Bronx Senior Citizen Center
Wallace Ford, Mid-Bronx Senior Citizen Center
Joe Palozzola, NYS Homes and Community Renewal
Joe Margulies, DHCR
Humberto Restrepo, Joint Industry Board of the Electrical Industry
Ross A. Frommer, Columbia University Medical Center
David Winters, Intrepid Air and Sea Museum
Irene Tsitko, Intrepid Air and Sea Museum
Gabrielle Breslow, Center for Employment Opportunities
Alison Bougatt, NYSAFAH
Rachel Sabella, TASC
Carla Precht, Bronx Children's Museum
Phil Jenkins, K. D. Dids, Inc.
Lenny Caro, Bronx Chamber
Elana Shneyer, Pratt Area Community Council
Nicole J. Yearwood, City Parks Foundation
William Bellinger
Rebekah MacFarlane, SOBRO
Sara Garretson, ITAC
Jonathan Stenger, Osborne Association
Amy Anderson, Pratt Center
William Budd, Hudson Square Connection
Alex Brussouansky, Volunteers of America
Chris Borgatti, NYU Langone Medical Center
Anne O'Hara, Callen-Lorde Community Health Center

Patricia Kerr, NHS of Jamaica, Inc.
Mike Heller, Albert Einstein College of Medicine
Medina Sadig, Southern Blvd. Business Improvement District
Loftin Flowers, Columbia University
Darryl Hollon, Economic Development Consultant
Nathalie Alegre, ALIGN
Louis Kilkenny, NHSNYC
Valerie Neng, WHEDCO
Earnest Langhorne, NYSHCR

I. Welcome and Introductions

Lieutenant Governor Duffy welcomed members of the public to the forum and invited President Felix Matos Rodriguez of Hostos Community College to speak. President Matos Rodriguez noted that Hostos has 7,000 undergraduates, mostly from the Bronx, who represent 115 countries, and an additional 11,000 students in continuing and workforce development. The college is an economic development engine for the Bronx. He encouraged investment in higher education institutions, which are a source of present and future economic stability. Public higher education is a good investment for families, as well as a good investment for New York. Hostos partners with the community to build capacity, particularly through its health care pipeline projects. He noted that Celina Sotomayor, the mother of the first Latina Supreme Court justice, Sonia Sotomayor, is a Hostos graduate.

II. Recap of Council Activities

Chancellor Goldstein then offered the public an overview of the council's activities. At the first meeting, the council identified assets, opportunities, and barriers related to economic development in the New York City region. Between the first and second meeting, work groups drafted a public participation strategy and a vision statement.

At the second meeting, the council broke into groups to discuss strategies and project criteria. It subsequently formed work groups to discuss these areas in greater detail, and formed another work group to identify regulatory barriers.

At the third meeting, the vision statement was approved. In addition, Deputy Mayor Robert Steel presented parts of PlaNYC and offered the Hunts Point Terminal Market as a priority project for inclusion in the council's strategic plan. The council broke into groups to identify priority projects for the city. Work groups later met to identify projects involving small business development, infrastructure, and human capital.

At the fourth meeting, the council discussed the New York Open for Business Statewide conference. Robert Yaro of the Regional Plan Association discussed economic development opportunities in regional centers outside of Manhattan. In addition, the council approved CFA endorsement standards and heard reports on working groups related to small business development, infrastructure, and human capital. It broke into groups to discuss the council's implementation plan and performance measures. Finally, council members were assigned to two committees: an application scoring committee and a writing plan committee. Kathy Wylde chaired that committee and was joined by Tokumbo Shobowale (representing

Deputy Mayor Steel), Sheena Wright, Paul Fernandes (representing Gary LaBarbara), Cesar Claro, Carol Conslato, and Suri Duitch.

III. Summary of Strategic Plan Writing Committee

Kathy Wylde noted that the council must create a five-year strategic plan for economic development in the region, with specific projects that will expand development. The committee started with the understanding that while New York City is the economic engine of the state, generating 55 percent of the state's economic output, it also has more people living in poverty than the entire rest of the state. The challenge is to bridge that gap to make the economy more inclusive. The council's plan attempts to do that. It identifies four areas of focus: quality of life; a pro-jobs, pro-growth strategy; investing in the future; and investing in innovation and inter-regional cooperation. The plan focuses on the city's relationship to the rest of the state and building strong industry clusters. The council will continue to engage experts to develop the plan and identify projects that reflect its vision. A draft of the plan will be posted to the "nyworks" website for viewing by November 2.

IV. Public Comment

Councilmember Diana Reyna: As chair of the small business committee and a member of the economic development committee, she works with the city's businesses and entrepreneurs and knows that access to capital, affordable industrial space, and collaborations with government are important to all businesses. The city needs to increase access to local, fresh food and increase manufacturing in all five boroughs. The community she represents in North Brooklyn need access to healthy food, and she supports EWVIDCO's application for a grant to do a feasibility study for a food processing facility in Queens.

Matthew D'Arrigo, co-president of Hunts Point Market. The market started more than 100 years ago and now employs 3,500 people and is the primary distributor of fresh food for the metropolitan area and the primary supplier to independent grocers and restaurateurs. But the market is 44 years old and too small, putting jobs and the industry at risk. The mayor has made the market expansion his No. 1 priority in order to maintain the symbiosis between independent grocers and Hunts Point.

Sid Davidoff, Davidoff Malito and Hutcher. The firm represents the Hunts Point Market. He appreciates the city's prioritization of the market expansion, as an additional 6,500 jobs rely on the market. The market now has to compete with a new market in Philadelphia. It needs the cooperation of all groups to make the expansion happen. He also noted that the Sheridan Expressway is an artery to the market, and that additional rail is important to the market.

Amy Anderson, Pratt Center. Strengthening New York's manufacturing industry is important. She supports EWVIDCO's application for a feasibility study to link New York farmers with the food industry. A more localized food supply chain would increase jobs and reduce emissions. Produce grown in New York State sometimes has to be shipped out of state before processing and distribution. The city needs more infrastructure to bring farmers and manufacturers together. The Pratt Center encourages the council to support this study.

Alex Brussovansky, Volunteers of America. He asks the council to consider assisted housing as part of its plan. These programs have a positive impact on residents and on the communities in which they are located. They create employment opportunities, greater utilization of services in the community, and increased property values. A site is being developed near Hostos that will provide supportive housing and create 60-70 temporary jobs and 16 permanent jobs.

Ross Frommer, Columbia University Medical Center. Academic medical institutions play an important role in the city, and the council should include language in the strategic plan that reflects this. A letter has been signed by all of the deans of the region's medical schools detailing why medical schools are so important to the city. Of the top 50 recipients of NIH funding, five are in New York City. While research is funded through grants and contracts, infrastructure funding is needed to improve facilities. This improves research and attracts talented researchers, each of whom is an economic development engine.

Lenny Caro, Bronx Chamber of Commerce. The Bronx needs help. Its future lies in the students at Hostos and other colleges. The chamber has started a junior chamber that will be implemented in schools to encourage entrepreneurship.

Ed Patuto, ISSUE Project Room. This hub for experimental arts and music in Brooklyn has been awarded a 20-year rent-free lease on a chamber hall in the former Board of Education building. ISSUE would outfit the theatre for contemporary art and performance, hosting 200 events per year. It would also offer residences for artists and have a partnership with NYU/Poly to allow artists to work with faculty and students. It is submitting a project under the CFA process to help renovate the space and would like the council's support.

Deborah Reid, Hostos Allied Health Career Pipeline: Hostos is uniquely positioned to contribute to the economic development of the Bronx and the entire city; it has a good location and is committed to community development and education. The pipeline project is helping low-income people get the training they need to get jobs in allied health care: nursing assistants, pharmacy technicians, community health workers, etc. It needs help from all partners in order to transform lives through allied health care.

Corwin Spivey, Hostos Jobs Plus Program. MDRC launched the Jobs Plus initiative for public housing residents, which offers employment services, financial incentives, and community support to help residents gain employment. The city's Center for Economic Opportunity has replicated the effort in Jefferson Houses, and Hostos is a partner. Sixty-two percent of working-age residents are not employed, and Jobs Plus is trying to transform Jefferson into a high-employment community. Counselors work with residents to get them into training programs and get them employed.

Carla Rabinowitz, Community Access. Community Access is a nonprofit for those recovering from mental illness, helping them access affordable housing and support services. Supportive housing brings jobs and money into neighborhoods that need both. People need a stable housing situation in order to get a stable job. They can then spend money in the community. The council should be aware of the economic impact of supportive housing.

Carolina Cordero Dyer, Osborne Association. The association helps those who come out of prison. It owns a building in Morrisania and has an opportunity to partner with three for-profit companies who are building three green businesses. The project could address the council's four main areas: quality-of-life issues (living-wage jobs in emerging green businesses), pro-jobs and pro-growth, investing in the future,

and investing in infrastructure and human capital. It would help employ people with criminal records, who are the hardest to employ. And it is an investment in innovation—the businesses' products are new. This project embodies the council's priorities.

Marlin Jenkins, Mid-Bronx Senior Citizens Council. The council is one of the leading social-service organizations in the Bronx and offers job training, counseling, literacy, education, day care, etc. It manages 28 buildings, 27 of which are residential. It offers affordable housing to seniors and jobs for local residents. It asks the council to include in its plan the council's new initiative to provide training in green tech and other industrial trades.

Nathalie Alegre, Alliance for a Greater New York. She commends the implementation of the CFA, as many nonprofits don't have the resources to hire consultants to apply for grants and loans. Regarding the performance metrics, the council should assess how well public money is being used to increase employment, improve quality of life, alleviate poverty, and maximize public investment. It should look at the number of jobs created, the number of local people employed, and the number of living-wage jobs that are created when it measures return on investment. It should measure how the region as a whole is doing—family income, jobs created, development of brown field sites, etc.

Louis Kilkenny, Neighborhood Housing Service of New York. He asks the council to support the application for a rehab grant to provide financial assistance to low-income homeowners for emergency home repairs.

Leah Archibald, EWVIDCO. The council should be aware of two proposals: a feasibility study for a fresh-food processing facility, and a capital grant for the purchase of two structures to preserve industrial space in perpetuity. She also noted that the CFA contains many questions about job creation. However, nonprofits are not the direct employers in a project. Just because a project won't result in direct employment doesn't mean that there won't be ancillary employment. She knows that the council values retaining industrial jobs and that real estate is a key concern in doing so.

Peter Fontanes, National Hispanic Construction Association. For the construction industry, there are four important components: job creation (there has been a drop in the employment of construction workers, and there should be renewed focus on green jobs); economic development; diversity; and the need to work with public-private alliances.

VI. Wrap-up

Marlene Cintron presented a birthday cake to Irene Baker in appreciation for all that she has done for the "Open for Business" process. The lieutenant governor thanked everyone for their work and thanked the public for participating, and reminded everyone that this is a chance to make change across the state.